

**FRANET**

**Migrants and their Descendants:  
Social Inclusion and  
Participation in Society**

**Estonia, 2015**

FRANET contractor: Institute of Baltic Studies  
Authors: Kallas, K.  
Reviewed by: Markina

DISCLAIMER: This document was commissioned under contract as background material for a comparative analysis by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) for the project '[Social Inclusion and Migrant Participation in Society](#)'. The information and views contained in the document do not necessarily reflect the views or the official position of the FRA. The document is made publicly available for transparency and information purposes only and does not constitute legal advice or legal opinion.

## Table of Contents

<b>Executive summary</b> .....	4
<b>1. Legal and policy instruments for migrant integration</b> .....	8
<b>1.1. Description of existing instruments and target groups</b> .....	8
<b>1.2. Drivers &amp; barriers in developing, implementing and assessing legal and policy instruments</b> .....	10
1.2.1. Drivers .....	11
1.2.2. Barriers.....	12
1.2.3. Language learning and integration tests.....	13
1.2.4. Monitoring and assessment – Use of indicators .....	18
1.2.5. Funding integration policies (EIF, ERF, EMIF) .....	19
<b>2. Promoting equal treatment and non-discrimination</b> .....	21
<b>2.1. The implementation of anti-discrimination legislation and equal treatment</b> .....	21
<b>2.2. Implementation of equal treatment of various permit holders</b> .....	26
2.2.1. Long Term Residence (LTR) status holders (Art.11 of the Directive 2003/109/EC) .....	26
2.2.2. Single-Single-permit procedure permit holders (Art.12 and 13 of the Directive 2011/98/EU) .....	26
2.2.3. Blue card holders (Art.14 and 12 of the Directive 2009/50/EC) .....	26
2.2.4. Family Family reunification permit holders (specifically in terms of access to labour market - Art. 14 of .....	27
2.2.5. Beneficiaries of international protection long term residence status holders ....	27
<b>2.3. Key developments and trends</b> .....	27
<b>3. Participation of migrants and their descendants in society</b> .....	28
<b>3.1. Political rights at national level</b> .....	28
3.1.1. Citizenship acquisition .....	28
3.1.2. National elections voting rights - turnout .....	32
3.1.3. National level election – representation .....	33
<b>3.2. Political rights at regional/local level</b> .....	33
3.2.1. Regional/Local elections voting rights – turnout.....	33
3.2.2. Regional/local level election – representation.....	35
<b>3.3. Consultation</b> .....	37
3.3.1. Consultative bodies at national/regional/local level .....	37
<b>3.4. Participation in trade-unions and professional association</b> .....	39
<b>3.5. Participation in social, cultural and public life</b> .....	43
3.5.1. Diversity in the public sector .....	46
<b>3.6. Political activity – active citizenship</b> .....	48
<b>3.7. Civic and citizenship education</b> .....	52
<b>3.8. Drivers, barriers for the implementation, monitoring and assessment of legislation &amp; policy measures</b> .....	57

<b>3.9. Use of funding instruments (EIF, ERF, EMIF)</b> .....	<b>59</b>
<b>3.10. Key legal and policy developments, and relevant case law</b> ....	<b>60</b>
<b>4. Social cohesion and community relations</b> .....	<b>61</b>
<b>4.1. Social cohesion policies</b> .....	<b>61</b>
<b>4.2. Combating racism and intolerance</b> .....	<b>65</b>
<b>4.3. Mixed marriages</b> .....	<b>66</b>
<b>Annex 2: National and regional level action plans on integration</b> .	<b>68</b>
<b>Annex 4: Indicators monitoring migrant integration - social inclusion/cohesion</b> .....	<b>76</b>
<b>Annex 5: Use of funding instruments</b> .....	<b>81</b>
Table 1 - European Integration Fund (EIF).....	81
Table 2 - European Refugee Fund (ERF) aiming at integration of beneficiaries of international protection.....	83
<b>Annex 7: Promising practices</b> .....	<b>84</b>
<b>Annex 8: Discrimination complaints submitted to Equality Bodies</b>	<b>85</b>
Table 3 – Numbers of discrimination cases on any ground submitted by third country nationals (TCNs) in 2014* .....	85
Table 4 - Outcome of discrimination cases on grounds of ethnic origin submitted by third country nationals* .....	86
<b>Annex 9: Case law – max 5 leading cases</b> .....	<b>87</b>

## Executive summary

There are two distinct groups of migrants living in Estonia:

a) So-called Russian-speaking immigrant community that is the largest migrant community and was mainly formed during the 50 years of Soviet rule. It comprises dominantly of persons who migrated into Estonia from other parts of Soviet Union, predominantly from Russia. Today so-called Russian-speaking population and their descendants constitute 30% of the general population.<sup>1</sup> Differently from other post-war migrant communities in Europe, however, Russian-speakers in Estonia do not consider themselves as migrants. From their perspective the movement into Estonia took place within the borders of unified Soviet state. This factor plays a crucial role in data collection as Russian-speakers consider it demeaning and excluding to be identified as migrants or descendants of migrants.

b) Newly arrived immigrants that have arrived to Estonia after the restoration of independence in 1991. This is relatively small community.

The total immigrant population constitute 223,900 (as of end of 2014) among whom 121,400 are first generation and 102,500 second generation.<sup>2</sup>

No official data is collected based on the migration history (for example employment in public sector or membership in trade unions or professional associations) of a person while some survey data allow to classify people based on their or their parents' place of birth.

Legal and policy instruments for migrant integration

Legal framework that concerns the integration of migrants has a number of legal instruments that regulate the rights and access to good and services for foreign nationals. However, the main two legal acts that concern the integration tools for large Russian-speaking community are Estonian Citizenship Act (*Kodakondsuseadus*) and Language Act (*Keeleseadus*). These two acts regulate the naturalisation into Estonian citizenship of TCN and people with "undetermined citizenship" and the requirements for the use of Estonian language. Apart from legal acts there are different policy instruments for abovementioned two migrant communities, namely:

- For Russian-speakers the main policy instruments are national integration programmes. In 2014 Estonia adopted its 3<sup>rd</sup> national integration strategy The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*)<sup>3</sup> that aims to overcome the cultural, political and socio-economic divide between majority Estonian and minority Russian-speaking population. After first decade of restoration of independence, in 2000 the course was taken in politics to facilitate integration with policy programmes. The main focus of integration policy has been on teaching Estonian language to Russian-speakers and facilitating naturalisation process. In recent years integration policy focus has moved more towards enhancing social cohesion, promoting mutual understanding and tolerance and building values supporting integration as a two-way process. As a result, Estonian majority has appeared as a target group more prominently in the current integration strategy. Recent integration

<sup>1</sup> Estonia, Statistics Estonia (*Statistikaamet*) (2014). PO0222: Population by sex, ethnic nationality and country, 1 January 2015. Available at: <http://pub.stat.ee/px-web.2001/Dialog/SaveShow.asp>

<sup>2</sup> Estonia, Statistics Estonia database, accessed 6 May 2015. Available at: <http://pub.stat.ee/px-web.2001/Database/Sotsiaalelu/15Tooturg/030Immigrantrahvastik/030Immigrantrahvastik.asp>

<sup>3</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eeesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eeesti.pdf)

monitoring surveys have shown that after rapid changes in 1990ies and 2000nds the proficiency in Estonian language among Russian-speaking population is not showing significant improvements any longer. Similarly, as language proficiency is a precondition for naturalisation, the naturalisation rates have also stalled.

- For newly arrived immigrants the main policy instruments are adaptation courses. In 2013 changes to the Aliens Act (*Välismaalaste seadus*) introduced the adaptation courses for the newly arrived immigrants who have lived in Estonia less than five years.<sup>4</sup> The objective of the adaptation programme is to support the migration process of the newly arrived immigrants by acquainting them with matters related to the functioning of the state and society, organisation of daily life, working, studying and family life, and to promote acquiring basic Estonian language skills.

#### Promoting equal treatment and non-discrimination

- There have been very few cases of complaints based on racial, linguistic, ethnic unequal treatment lodged either to Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner or to labour inspectorates (if complaint concerns discrimination on the labour market). At the same time according to the study *Equal Treatment in Estonia: Awareness and Promotion (Võrdse kohtlemise edendamise ja teadlikkus Eestis)*<sup>5</sup> Russian citizens and those with undetermined citizenship exhibit the greatest uncertainty or lack of knowledge with regard to awareness of what to do in case of discrimination.
- There have been no outreach and awareness raising campaigns undertaken by national or regional public authorities in Estonia in recent years. Therefore it is hard to estimate whether the low number of complaints indicates low levels of discrimination or lack of awareness among the target groups about the ways and means of protection against discrimination.
- Promoting equal treatment and non-discrimination has not yet become a priority in national integration policy. The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" declares equal treatment as an important target, however, fails to develop specific measures and actions to tackle the problem. Similarly Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner, whose task is to help people protect their rights and to avoid any form of discrimination has not focused on promoting equal treatment based on race, language or ethnicity. Several political groupings and civil society organisations have pointed to the problem of under financing of Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner that has resulted in only one focus of its work, which is gender equality.<sup>6 7</sup>

#### Participation of migrants and their descendants in society

- Although integration strategies have been adopted and implemented in Estonia since 2000, no major changes to the legal framework regulating integration, political rights and political participation have been adopted (Citizenship Act, Language Act).

<sup>4</sup> Estonia, Aliens Act (*Välismaalaste seadus*), § 121, RT I 2010, 3, 4. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/513042015008/consolide>

<sup>5</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*) (2013). *Equal Treatment in Estonia: Awareness and Promotion (Võrdse kohtlemise edendamise ja teadlikkus Eestis)*. Available at: [http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20\(2013\)%20-%20EN.pdf](http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20(2013)%20-%20EN.pdf)

<sup>6</sup> Estonia, Request for clarification concerning the financing of the bureau of Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (*Arupärimine. Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise voliniku büroo rahastusest*), 14 November 2012. Available at:

<sup>7</sup> Estonia, ECRI (2010). ECRI Report on Estonia (fourth monitoring cycle) points 64-67. (CRI(2010)3). Adopted 2 March 2010. Available at: <http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/Country-by-country/Estonia/EST-CbC-IV-2010-003-ENG.pdf>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- TNCs, among whom are also people with undetermined citizenship (8% of Estonia's population) have political voting rights in local elections, but they are not allowed to be members of political parties, run as candidates or also vote in national elections. Almost all political parties run their election campaigns also in Russian language and no major practical barriers to exercise political rights can be identified.</li> <li>- Although a public debate has been focused on the representation of Russian-speaking population in Estonian politics via candidates, members in the parties or elected representatives, no data could be provided about the proportions of Russian-speakers as the collection of this data is not considered appropriate and is deemed to classify people and work against the objectives of integration policy. Furthermore, Russian-speakers themselves often resist classifying them in any other way from Estonians. The main dissatisfaction has been expressed on terms "others" (<i>muulased</i>) and "residents with immigrant background" (<i>sisserände taustaga püsielanikud</i>).</li> <li>- There are no migrant's consultative bodies in place at national or local level. There is a Roundtable of National Minorities at the office of the President of Estonia, however, it has not been functional in recent years. However, the practice of migrant consultation on law and policy has taken place in ad hoc basis.</li> <li>- Legal barriers for participation of TCNs in trade unions, professional associations, political movements (i.e. all social movements except for political parties), cultural, media or sports associations do not exist. There are some limitations set by the Language Act (<i>Keeleseadus</i>), which says that the employees of non-profit associations and foundations, as well as the members of the board of the non-profit associations with the compulsory membership must be proficient in Estonian to the level that is necessary to perform their employment duties. This shall be applied if it is justified in the public interest.<sup>8</sup> However, the lack of proficiency in Estonian language is less of a legal than a practical problem in participation of migrants and their descendants in civil society. According to the Integration Monitoring survey 2011 (<i>Integratsiooni monitooring 2011</i>) the political activity rate of non-citizens and people with undetermined citizenship is generally lower than the political activity rates of Estonian citizens (regardless of their ethnicity). The survey report argues that the language barrier is seen as a main barrier by Estonian associations for low participation of Russian-speaking population in the civil society associations.<sup>9</sup></li> </ul> <p><u>Social cohesion and community relations</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Social cohesion policies are relatively new and it is hard to evaluate the outcomes and impacts of these policies. National integration strategies have not addressed the issues of social cohesion comprehensively until today. The new integration strategy that was adopted at the end of 2014, discusses as its main aim to achieve socially cohesive society, however, there is no clear definition or description of what are the indicators of socially cohesive society. There is somewhat more heightened focus on expressions of intolerance among the majority population compared to previous integration strategies. However, there is little focus on measures and actions that would promote social cohesion in the strategy.</li> <li>- Community relations have been in the focus in integration monitoring studies. The monitoring have looked at interethnic contacts, tolerance</li> </ul>
--	--

<sup>8</sup> Estonia, Language act (*Keeleseadus*) § 23 (2). RT I, 18.03.2011, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/514012015007/consolide>

<sup>9</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

	and valuing of multiculturalism by the different groups of populations (majority Estonians and minority Russian-speakers). The survey show that while on institutional level the density of contacts is high (at work, at school, in the public) then on personal level the social networks remain ethnically/linguistically limited to one's own group. <sup>10</sup>
--	--

---

<sup>10</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), p. 48. Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

# 1. Legal and policy instruments for migrant integration

## 1.1. Description of existing instruments and target groups

	<p>This section should present the overall state of play concerning national and, where applicable, regional legal and policy instruments focusing on how they address fundamental rights, core EU values and principles, as well as international legal standards and related EU law and policies, such as the Common Basic Principles and the Common Agenda on integration of migrants. Please complete the <b>template in Annex 2</b>. Please make sure the brief information you provide in the table includes the following aspects:</p>
<p>Does the national strategy on migrant integration contain a definition of integration? If so, please include it in the original language and full English translation.</p>	<p>The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>)<sup>11</sup> states that integration is "multilateral process of the formation of social cohesion in society between people with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds. The process is characterized by knowledge and skill acquisition and the evolution of values that contribute to the development of society through practical cooperation and mutual openness. As a result of integration, society's socio- economic inequalities and unequal opportunities of participation caused by the differences in cultural, linguistic, religious and ethnic affiliations will be minimised and the resulting social capital enables the Estonian society to evolve coherently" (our translation). (<i>Mitme poolne sotsiaalse sidususe tekke protsess ühiskonnas eri keelelis-kultuurilise taustaga inimeste vahel. Protsessi iseloomustab teadmiste, oskuste omandamine ja väärtuste kujunemine, mis panustavad ühiskonna arengusse läbi praktilise koostöö ja vastastikuse avatuse. Lõimumise tulemusena väheneb ühiskonnaliikmete kultuurilisest, keelelisest, religioosest ja rahvuslikust kuuluvusest tingitud sotsiaalmajanduslik ebavõrdsus ja osalemine ühiskonnaelus ning tekkiv sotsiaalne kapital võimaldab ühiskonnal ühtselt areneda</i>).</p>
<p>Are there specific references in the national strategy or relevant legal or policy instruments to fundamental rights in relation to migrants?</p>	<p>The national strategy "Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>) mentions EU Fundamental Rights Charter in the list among other international conventions that Estonia has joined and that affect the implementation of integration policies in Estonia. However, differently from the previous strategy (2008-2013) the current programme does not refer specifically to the fundamental rights of migrants.</p>
<p>Which are the target groups of the national integration strategy? Please provide any</p>	<p>Target groups of Estonian integration strategy are both permanent residents of Estonia, including nationals and recent migrants. The specific beneficiaries of various measures are: the whole population with an emphasis on Estonian-speaking part of population; ethnic and cultural minorities associations; Russian-speakers who are either with undetermined citizenship or otherwise poorly integrated;</p>

<sup>11</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)



<p>definitions relevant or the determination of the persons that are entitled to or beneficiaries of the relevant action plans and policy measures (e.g. 'integration agreements': who signs them and what do they contain). Please specify any residence requirements (e.g. which migrant and/or residence status counts or not for "legally residing third country nationals" that eventually would be covered by these policies) for persons to be considered members of the targeted groups.</p>	<p>new immigrants; school students, youth, and working populations whose mother tongue is other than Estonian; public servants; refugees; teachers and directors of educational institutions; youth workers; and the unemployed.<sup>12</sup></p> <p>For person to be considered members of the beneficiary target groups they have to be legally residing in Estonia either as nationals, third country nationals (TCN) with short- and long-term residency and beneficiaries of international protection. There is no time limit for residency, i.e. beneficiaries can be wither newly arrived immigrants who have resided in Estonia less than five years or migrants who have migrated after the II WW. The beneficiaries of the adaptation programme (<i>kohanemisprogramm</i>) are legally residing TCN who arrived to Estonia no more than five years prior as well as EU citizens other than Estonian citizens.<sup>13</sup> Police and Boarder Guard Board (<i>Politsei- ja Piirivalveamet</i>) assigns foreign nationals to the adaptation programme course,<sup>14</sup> however, attendance is not compulsory. The programme comprises of: 1) learning the Estonian language, 2) lectures and tours introducing the life, culture and values of Estonian society, and 3) preparation for employment.</p>
<p>In reference to the CBP 1 'Integration is a dynamic, two-way process of mutual accommodation by all immigrants and residents of Member States': please specify if and how the majority population is explicitly targeted; distinguish, if</p>	<p>The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>) include measures that are targeted at majority population. However, the target is rather the whole population – a minority and majority – than just a majority specifically. Measures targeting general population are as follows: communication actions and campaigns in order to improve peoples' understanding of multiculturalism, developing common values that support integration among population via media, and developing a single joint information field, The latter refers to the gap in media consumption between Estonian majority and Russian-speaking minority. The minority is consuming mainly Russian Federation media and as a result is less informed about the life and politics in Estonia. This results in their marginalisation, lower political activism as well as creates different value systems. The aim of the integration policy is to provide more information from Estonian sources in Russian language to the Russian-speaking community.</p>

<sup>12</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf); Estonian Ministry of Culture (*Kultuuriministeerium*) (2014). The Implementation Plan for the Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" rakendusplaan aastateks 2014–2017*). Available at: <http://www.kul.ee/et/valdkondlik-arengukava-loimuv-eesti-2020>.

<sup>13</sup> Estonia, Introduction programme (*Kohanemisprogramm*), Regulation of the Minister of the Interior, RT I, 22.08.2014, 5, adopted 13.08.2014 No 34. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/122082014005>

<sup>14</sup> Estonia, Aliens Act (*Välismaalaste seadus*), § 121, RT I 2010, 3, 4. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/513042015008/consolide>

	possible, between policies or measures targeting the general population and specific target groups, such as public authorities, e.g. teachers, police, judiciary, etc.; outline the objectives of such policies and measures, and their duration.	Measures targeting specific groups are as follows: analysis of public servants ethnic/linguistic background, the development of additional training programmes for personnel and teachers at schools. <sup>15</sup> The national integration strategy emphasises the importance to value cultural diversity and to take into account the right of Estonian residents with different cultural and ethnic background to use their language and express their cultural affiliations. Encouraging contacts between different cultures is also seen as an important strategy facilitating integration. Efforts will be made to increase everybody's knowledge of anti-discrimination measures and of the importance of the principle of equal treatment. <sup>16</sup>
--	---	---

## 1.2. Drivers & barriers in developing, implementing and assessing legal and policy instruments

	On the basis of material collected, including past research, studies, assessments, evaluation and contacts with the authorities, public officials and key actors for social inclusion and participation of migrants, outline the main drivers and barriers for	The <u>general drivers</u> of the social inclusion and integration policies stem from the need to resolve an ethnic/linguistic conflict in Estonia between majority Estonia and minority Russian-speaking Soviet time settlers' communities. The conflict is seen as undermining the development of the nation, democracy and the security of the state. <sup>17 18</sup>  The second set of drivers stem from the consolidation of democracy and the right consciousness of the minority as well as majority. Integration monitoring studies have shown that liberal multicultural values are more accepted by the new generations of policy-makers than the older ones. Containing the ethnic conflict with non-democratic measures such as denial of political rights to minorities is less accepted by the policy-makers today. <sup>19</sup> Also the attitudes of majority Estonian community has become more open towards participation of Russian-speaking minority in politics and social life. <sup>20</sup> The research has shown that additionally the effect of EU
--	--	--

<sup>15</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf); Estonian Ministry of Culture (*Kultuuriministeerium*) (2014). The Implementation Plan for the Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" rakendusplaan aastateks 2014–2017*). Available at: <http://www.kul.ee/et/valdkondlik-arengukava-loimuv-eesti-2020>.

<sup>16</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)

<sup>17</sup> Estonia, Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)

<sup>18</sup> See also academic research on ethnic conflict and divided society in Estonia: Pettai, V., Hallik, K. (2000) 'Understanding processes of ethnic control: Segmentation, dependency and cooptation in post-communist Estonia', *Nations and Nationalism*, 8: 505-29; Kallas, K. and Kaldur, K. (2010). 'Estonia: A Post-Soviet Predicament' in *Inclusion And Exclusion Of Young Adult Immigrants: Barriers and Bridges*. Katrine Fangen, Kirsten Fossan and Ferdinand Andreas Mohn (eds.). London: Ashgate

<sup>19</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>20</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), p. 230. Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

	<p>social inclusion and integration policies <b>in general</b>. Please mention also any important differences at regional level. A more detailed outline of <b>specific</b> drivers and barriers for specific policy areas will be required in the following sections.</p>	<p>conditionality policy during the enlargement process cannot be underestimated.<sup>21</sup></p> <p>Research has also shown that the factor that drives integration and social cohesion policies is the demands and expectations of equal treatment and equal opportunities raised by the second and third generation of Russian-speakers.<sup>22</sup> As the result of the emergence of second and third generation that enters the political, economic, cultural and social scene, the striving for equality of this generation calls for social cohesion policy measures.</p> <p>The <u>main barriers</u> for successful integration are manifold.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Impact of neighbouring Russia on Estonian integration process. Russia's role as a motherland<sup>23</sup> and the securitization of the minority-majority relations in that context<sup>24</sup> constitute a significant barrier in advancement of integration as a two-way process.</li> <li>- Based on integration monitoring studies it can be argued that structural barriers for successful integration are: higher unemployment among Russian-speaking minority, lack of citizenship among still significant number of Russian-speakers, low levels of proficiency of state language in some segments of population and geographical isolation in certain regions, mainly Ida-Virumaa.<sup>25</sup></li> <li>- Similarly based on integration monitoring studies barriers for cultural, interactive and identificational integration are: historical memory conflicts between two communities, also commemoration days (folk, religious and national holidays) conflicts as well as segregated education system and information field (media consumption).<sup>26</sup></li> </ul>
<h3>1.2.1. Drivers</h3>		
	<p>The key drivers for successful integration policies, therefore factors that are considered to contribute positively in the design, development,</p>	<p>The need to resolve the ethnic conflict in between majority Estonia and minority Russian-speaking Soviet time settlers' communities has been driving the integration policies since early 2000s. The key driver that gives a promise of successful integration policy is a new focus of integration effort on the general population rather than solely on the minority integration effort. Differently from the previous integration strategies the new strategy puts the emphasis on the evolution of values that contribute to the development of socially coherent society. These values are mainly defined as the ones supporting equality within the diversity.</p>

<sup>21</sup> Estonia, Pettai, V. and Kallas, K. (2009). "Estonia: conditionality amidst a legal straightjacket" in *Minority Rights in Central and Eastern Europe*, ed. Bernd Rechel. Basees/Routledge Series on Russian and East European Studies.

<sup>22</sup> Estonia, Vetik, R., Helemaäe, J. (Ed) (2011). *The Russian Second Generation in Tallinn and Kohtla-Järve*. Amsterdam University Press IMISCOE Reports.

<sup>23</sup> On the discussion about ethnic minorities, nationalising states and ethnic minority kin states see Brubaker, R. (1996). *Nationalism Reframed: Nationhood and the Nationalist Question in New Europe*, Cambridge University Press

<sup>24</sup> On securitization of minority relations in Eastern Europe see Kymlicka, W. (2001). 'Western Political Theory and Ethnic Relations in Eastern Europe' in Will Kymlicka and Magda Opalski *Can Liberal Pluralism be Exported?* Oxford: Oxford University Publishing.

<sup>25</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf); Estonia, Estonian Social Integration Monitoring 2008 (*Eesti ühiskonna integratsiooni monitooring 2008*), Integration Foundation and Bureau of Minister of Population. Available at: [http://www.meis.ee/raamatukogu?book\\_id=196](http://www.meis.ee/raamatukogu?book_id=196)

<sup>26</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

	<p>implementation, assessment and accomplishment of policy goals and in strengthening social inclusion and participation of migrants and their descendants. For example, are these policies mainstreamed in other public policies, for example in employment, education, housing, etc. and how is this achieved?</p>	<p>Integration monitoring study<sup>27</sup> has identified the following processes that drive integration:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Significant increase of people with Estonian citizenship among Russian-speaking youth (second and third generation of migrants); significant improvement in the proficiency of Estonian language among the Russian-speaking youth.</li> <li>- Increased sense of belonging to Estonian nation and identifying Estonia as a sole homeland is increased among the Russian-speaking population.</li> <li>- Sense of unequal treatment expressed by Russian-speaking minority has decreased over the years and the openness of Estonian majority to accept minority as equal partner in political participation is slowly developing.</li> </ul> <p>However, the policies are not generally mainstreamed into other public policies. The guidelines prepared by the Ministry of Finance (<i>Rahandusministeerium</i>) Reoccurring subjects in Sectorial Development Plans. Guidance Document for Authors. Working document 26.05.2014 (<i>Läbivad teemad valdkonna arengukavas. Juhendmaterjal arengukava koostajale. Töödokument 26.05.2014</i>) regulate that equal opportunities for people with different ethnic and national background should be one of the mainstreamed into all development plans (<i>arengukavad</i>) prepared by the different ministries and state bodies.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless the state development plans in other policy areas barely mention the integration challenges. As an example, the labour market services do not differentiate based on the ethnic or national belonging despite of the integration monitoring studies and annual statistics on unemployment show significant gaps in labour market participation among Estonian majority and Russian-speaking minority population.</p>
--	--	---

### 1.2.2.Barriers

	<p>Barriers, limitations, constraints or resistance faced in designing, developing and implementing such policies and measures, therefore factors that may hinder their effectiveness and influence negatively their outcomes. For example,</p>	<p>The main barrier in designing, developing and implementing integration policy lies in small political will to achieve the objectives. According to consulted minority leaders the core political elite does not consider the integration strategy and mainly the stress on equality within the diversity as a valuable tool to resolve the ethnic/linguistic conflict in society and rather indicates that "hard policy measures" such as coercion and control of political rights (citizenship rights) accompanied with the requirements for language proficiency knowledge for minorities will work more effectively towards resolving the conflict inherited from the Soviet period.<sup>29</sup> There are assimilationist values still evident in many policy measures that affect social cohesion (citizenship policy, language policy). As a result of the lack of integration values among the political elite it can be argued that it will be hard to support the development and spread of those values among general population as is aimed in the integration strategy.</p>
--	---	---

<sup>27</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>28</sup> Estonia, Reoccurring subjects in Sectorial Development Plans. Guidance Document for Authors. Working document 26.05.2014 (*Läbivad teemad valdkonna arengukavas. Juhendmaterjal arengukava koostajale. Töödokument 26.05.2014*). Ministry of Finance and State Chancellery. Available at: <http://www.fin.ee/riigi-strateegiline-juhtimine/>

<sup>29</sup> Estonia, telephone conversations with Ms. Yana Toom, Member of European Parliament, Estonian Central Party 23 April 2015; Mihhail Kõlvart, vice-mayor of Tallinn, Estonian Central Party 24 April 2015.

	<p>budgetary limitations, or problems of coordination of governance levels, priority of interventions, lack of training or lack of mainstreaming of relevant policies, lack of action by competent actors or limited data about the interested population, could be factors that may function as obstacles or affect negatively the implementation of selected migrant integration measures.</p>	<p>The second barrier in the implementation of the integration policy lies in the lack of policy mainstreaming and inter-ministerial cooperation in the implementation of the policy (see more above under 1.2.1 Drivers). There are four key ministries involved in the implementation of the policy – Ministry of Culture as a lead ministry, Ministry of the Interior (citizenship issues, welcoming programmes for new immigrants), Ministry of Education and Research (schools, language learning) and Ministry of Social Affairs (labour market, health, equal treatment) – but the cooperation between the ministries is weak. Despite of the Ministry of Culture being the lead ministry, there is no political “head” to the policy that would have the powers to mainstream the policy into the other policy areas of the other ministries. As an example, labour market policy coordinated by the Ministry of Social Affairs has little if any focus on equal treatment based on the ethnicity/language.</p> <p>Last but not least, neighbouring Russia as a kin-state for the minority is seen as one of the factors influencing the conflict and interfering with the integration and social cohesion efforts. Integration monitoring studies have pointed out that Russian-speaking population is consuming actively Russian Federation media and receives less information from the Estonian sources.<sup>30</sup> Russian media is seen as the main tool of interference and stemming from that the need to “bring Russian-speaking community into common Estonian/European information sphere” through developing a local Russian-language media is seen as one of the main objectives of integration policies.</p>
--	--	--

### 1.2.3. Language learning and integration tests

Please provide information about:		
	<p>Main language learning support programmes and courses. Provide details about organisation of such programmes and actors implementing them, funding support, location, duration, frequency, numbers of beneficiaries, entitlements and limitations for</p>	<p>Estonian Integration and Migration Foundation Our People (MISA) (<i>Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed</i>), and its forerunners – the Integration Foundation (<i>Integratsiooni Sihtasutus</i>) and the Estonian Migration Foundation (<i>Eesti Migratsiooni Fond</i>) have provided Estonian language courses since 1998. MISA offers a variety of language-learning options: professional Estonian studies; reimbursement of study costs; workplace exchanges between Estonian and Russian-speaking employees; language teaching in institutions; free language studies for citizens of third countries; language studies for Estonians who have returned to homeland; and more. Language teaching is financed through the European Social Fund and the European Fund for the Integration of Third-Country Nationals, as well as from the national budget via the Ministry of Culture (<i>Kultuuriministeerium</i>), the Ministry of Education and Research (<i>Haridus- ja Teadusministeerium</i>) and the Ministry of the Interior (<i>Siseministeerium</i>). In 2015 the free Estonian language courses are aimed at unemployed and under privileged European third-country nationals as well as people with undetermined citizenship. Free language courses were carried out only in two</p>

<sup>30</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf); Estonia, Report of a Study of Estonian Integration Monitoring 2008 (*Uuringu Eesti Ühiskonna Integratsiooni Monitooring 2008 aruanne*), Integratiin Foundation and the Bureau of Minister of Population. Available at: [http://www.meis.ee/raamatukogu?book\\_id=196](http://www.meis.ee/raamatukogu?book_id=196);



accessing courses.	<p>Estonian regions of Harjumaa and Ida-Virumaa where the majority of TCNs live.<sup>31</sup></p> <p>Anyone who passes an Estonian language examination at the levels of A2, B1, B2 or C1 has the right to have their language learning fees reimbursed, with the exception of those applying for Estonian citizenship or those required to take the language examination by the Language Inspectorate, since these target groups are covered by a separate financing scheme described below (see below). The fees are reimbursed within a period of two months after the completion of the exam. The initiative is financed by the European Social Fund.</p> <p>The number of beneficiaries of free language courses offered by MISA for all TCNs is as follows (including both new immigrants and other TCNs) for Estonian language courses on the basis of Russian language (the amount of people who completed the course):</p> <p>2009/2010 – 1216  2010/2011 – 238  2011/2012 – 182  2012/2013 – 522  2013/2014 – 560</p> <p>The amount of beneficiaries of courses directed to newly immigrated TCNs with English as the language of instruction:</p> <p>2009/2010 – 56  2010/2011 – 37  2011/2012 – 55  2012/2013 – 122  2013/2014 – 176 (courses ended abruptly due to the premature termination of the contract between MISA and Ltd. Immisoft, the provider of the service - thus the number of people indicated here is the number of participants who took part in the course).<sup>32</sup></p> <p>However, some of the recent migrants have expressed their concern that there is not enough information available about the courses.<sup>33</sup> Language courses' reimbursement is also offered for the applicants of Estonian citizenship, for those who have been forced by the language inspection to take the courses, or for people who cannot receive the reimbursement on the previously mentioned grounds, but have previously passed an Estonian language test on one of these levels: A2, B1, B2 or C1.<sup>34</sup> SA Innove who provides the reimbursement states that they do not gather information about the frequency and the location of the courses as applicants are themselves responsible for finding the appropriate courses they want to attend.<sup>35</sup></p> <p>Language learning is also available via online tool <i>Keeleklikk</i>. It is an online Estonian course for beginners and is suitable for individual study and also for classroom use. <i>Keeleklikk</i> targets adult learners who want to learn how to communicate in everyday situations. It is designed for both English and Russian speakers and should help the independent learner to reach level A2. The course consists of 16</p>
--------------------	--

<sup>31</sup> Estonia, Integration and Migration Foundation Our People (*Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed*) (2015), E-mail correspondence with Ruslan Prohhorenko, coordinator, 3 February 2015.

<sup>32</sup> Estonia, Migration Foundation Our People (*Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed*) (2015), E-mail correspondence with Ruslan Prohhorenko, coordinator, 26 February 2015.

<sup>33</sup> Estonia, The Agenda of the Integration of Foreigners and the Talent Policy, Seminar in Kamahouse, Tallinn, 20 February 2015. Available at: <http://kamamaja.net/>

<sup>34</sup> Estonia, The Reimbursement of Estonian Language Studies (*Eesti keele õppe kulude hüvitamine*) Available at: <http://www.innove.ee/et/eesti-keele-tasemeeksamid/eesti-keele-oppe-kulude-hyvitamine>

<sup>35</sup> Estonia, SA Innove, E-mail correspondence with Rain Sannik, head of unit, 25 March 2015.

		comprehensive language learning units that include a total of 200 animations, over 100 videos that explain grammar and roughly 1200 exercises. <i>Keeleklikk</i> also features a real Estonian teacher with whom students can exchange letters via e-mail. The project is financed by European Social Fund and the Estonian Ministry of Education and Research. Use of online tool is free of charge.
	Knowledge level of the language achieved through such programmes (please use the <u>Common European Framework Reference levels - CEFR</u> )	A2, B1, B2 or C1. <sup>36 37</sup>
	Language tests required for migrants to access residence or other legal status affecting equal treatment and access to rights. Please provide information about their content and character, level of knowledge required, numbers of participants, and rates of success/failure	<p>According to the Aliens Act (<i>Välismalaste seadus</i>) the applicants of long-term residence permits are required to demonstrate knowledge of the Estonian language at least on B1 level.<sup>38</sup></p> <p>For several years, people receiving international protection were not eligible to participate in Estonian language courses that were financed under the European Fond for Integration of Third Country Nationals. However, this problem is now solved.</p> <p>Test are taken by migrants who wish to acquire Estonian citizenship, who have been forced by the Estonian Language Inspection to take them, or who wish to do so out of any personal preference and without any specific aim. Also, since people applying for long-term residence permits are required to prove their proficiency in Estonian language on B1 level some applicants for the residency take courses provided by SA Innove. However, the exact motives of registered test takers cannot be identified in the statistical data provided below.</p> <p>Statistics regarding all the participants who passed/did not pass the examinations registered by AS Innove is as follows:<sup>39</sup></p> <p>Level A2:  2009 – 1092/398  2010 – 1425/600  2011 – 1024/417  2012 – 1176/380  2013 – 902/308</p> <p>Level B1:  2009 – 1178/985  2010 – 1804/1492  2011 – 1504/1453  2012 – 1739/1064  2013 – 1672/380</p> <p>Level B2:</p>

<sup>36</sup> Estonia, Integration and Migration Foundation Our People (*Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed*) (2015), E-mail correspondence with Ruslan Prohhorenko, coordinator, 3 February 2015.

<sup>37</sup> Estonia, The regulation regarding the structure and conduct of Estonian language proficiency examinations (*Eesti keele tasemeeksamite ülesehitus ja läbiviimise kord*), § 3(2). RT I, 16.06.2011, 6. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/113092012005?leiaKehtiv>

<sup>38</sup> Estonia, Aliens act (*Välismalaste seadus*) § 234 (1), RT I, 29.06.2012, 51. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/529012015006/consolide>

<sup>39</sup> Estonia, SA Innove: Statistics and Analysis. Available at: <http://www.innove.ee/et/eesti-keele-tasemeeksamid/tasemeeksamite-statistika-ja-analysid>

		<p>2009 – 455/884  2010 – 680/1079  2011 – 648/891  2012 – 493/987  2013 – 454/922</p> <p>Level C1:  2009 – 623/1189  2010 – 557/755  2011 – 426/888  2012 – 396/890  2013 – 390/770</p> <p>The content of these examinations complies with The Common European Framework of Reference for Languages and consists of four parts: reading, listening, writing and talking.</p>
	<p>Integration tests for access to residence or other status affecting equal treatment and access to rights. Please provide information about their content and character, range of knowledge required, numbers of participants, and rates of success/failure.</p>	<p>No integration tests are required for residence status. Ministry of the Interior (<i>Siseministeerium</i>) has developed an integration programme for legal immigrants (<i>kohanemisprogramm</i>), who have resided in Estonia for a period of less than five years. The implementation of the programme will begin 1 August 2015.<sup>40</sup> According to the Aliens Act (<i>Välismaalaste seadus</i>), the Police and Boarder Guard (<i>Politsei- ja Piirivalveamet</i>) sends a residence holder to the integration programme courses.<sup>41</sup> Participation in these courses, however, is not compulsory and prolonging residence permit does not depend on the attendance of the courses.<sup>42</sup></p>
	<p>Mother tongue learning programmes for children of migrants</p>	<p>Estonia's basic and upper secondary level school system is operating in two languages: there are schools with Estonian language of instruction and schools with Russian language of instruction. Russian-speaking children can attend basic education (<i>põhikool</i>) in their mother tongue in case local municipality has decided to run Russian-language basic school. Prior to upper-secondary level (<i>gümnaasium</i>), some schools teach exclusively in Estonian and other exclusively in Russian. However, in the latter, learning Estonian as a second language is compulsory starting from the first grade. Additionally, many Russian schools have also introduced voluntarily classes in Estonian language of instruction with an aim to improve teaching of Estonian. In upper secondary level (<i>gümnaasium</i>) the language of instruction in all schools is Estonian, but in some schools 40% of the subjects are still taught in Russian. According to the Basic Schools and Upper Secondary Schools Act (<i>Põhikooli ja gümnaasiumi seadus</i>) for upper secondary schools the permission to pursue studies in another language or bilingual studies (i.e. more than 40% of subjects would be taught in</p>

<sup>40</sup> Estonia, Ministry of the Interior (*Siseministeerium*), E-mail correspondence with Ms Liana Roosmaa, Adviser, Internal Security Department, 11 February 2015.

<sup>41</sup> Estonia, Aliens act (*Välismaalaste seadus*) § 234 (1), RT I, 29.06.2012, 51. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/529012015006/consolide>

<sup>42</sup> Estonia, Ministry of the Interior (*Siseministeerium*), Telephone conversation with Ms Liana Roosmaa, Adviser, Internal Security Department, 9 March 2015.



		<p>another language) is granted by the Government of the Republic on the basis of an application of a municipality.</p> <p>Additionally, there are five secondary and upper-secondary private schools and two state schools in which the language of instruction is English, and two schools in Finnish.</p> <p>The mother tongue learning for children of migrants is primarily accomplished via Sunday Schools (<i>pühapäevakool</i>) run by the respective national minority cultural associations. Pursuant to the Private Schools Act (<i>Erakooliseadus</i>) national minorities cultural associations are allowed to establish Sunday Schools to organise a comprehensive study of mother tongue and national culture.<sup>43</sup> The funding of Sunday Schools is allocated to the schools by the Ministry of Education and Research (<i>Haridus- ja Teadusministeerium</i>) through Integration and Migration Foundation Our People (<i>Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed</i>) through annual call for applications.</p>
	<p>Please provide insights about key issues, debates, challenges or problems related to the implementation of the above measures and policies. The findings should be substantiated through existing assessments, research or studies and case law (<b>use template in Annex 9</b>).</p>	<p>Regarding state language learning for migrants and mother tongue learning for children of migrants the following issues can be identified:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- the knowledge of state language among Russian-speaking population has not improved significantly in recent years. Only 36% of Russian-speaking respondents in Integration monitoring survey 2011 said they have good proficiency in Estonian language while 16% admitted they have no knowledge of Estonian language and another 19% reported some passive knowledge in understanding Estonian.<sup>44</sup></li> <li>- there are not enough information about the availability of free language learning courses for migrants. Additionally, the possibilities to learn language for free are limited for adults who are not either taking citizenship tests or who are not unemployed.<sup>45</sup></li> <li>- at the same time language knowledge is one of the main barriers impeding the full participation of migrants and Russian-speakers in Estonia (see the language regulations regarding participation in social and political life below). Language knowledge is also identified as the main barrier in access to the labour market equal to the ethnic Estonians.<sup>46</sup></li> <li>- the reform of Russian-language upper-secondary schools which focused on transfer of these schools into the majority (60%) Estonian-language of instruction by 2011 caused strong opposition and dissatisfaction among Russian-speaking community. Several schools in Tallinn and Ida-Virumaa county applied for the exception rule to continue to teach full curricula in Russian language. The exceptions were not accepted by the Ministry of Education and Research that caused a further conflict. Russian-speaking population saw this reform as an attempt of assimilation that denies the community right to educate their children fully in Russian-language</li> </ul>

<sup>43</sup> Estonia, Private Schools act (*Erakooliseadus*), RT I 1998, 57, 859. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/520122013001/consolide>

<sup>44</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>45</sup> Estonia, Uus, M. & Kaldur, K. (2013). Open Forums on Integration: Report on Recommendations by Third-Country Nationals regarding Estonia's Integration Policy (*Euroopa kolmandate riikide kodanike lõimumisarutelude aruanne*), Praxis Centre for Policy Studies, Institute of Baltic Studies. Available at: [file:///C:/Users/Pille/Downloads/MISA\\_raport\\_ENGL.pdf](file:///C:/Users/Pille/Downloads/MISA_raport_ENGL.pdf)

<sup>46</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

		only. Additionally concerns were voiced over the practical aspects of the reform, mainly the availability of teachers who are capable of teaching subjects in Estonian language to Russian-speaking pupils in Russian schools. Currently the issue is still debated.
<b>1.2.4. Monitoring and assessment – Use of indicators</b>		
	In this section please outline monitoring and evaluation procedures applied by public authorities at national and regional level, as applicable, for migrant integration. In particular, please present any indicators used for the monitoring, assessment and review of integration policies in the areas of political and social participation, social cohesion, and intolerance, inclusive and welcoming society. Please make sure to report here the link of such indicators with fundamental rights and the way their use reflects to the review of such policies.	<p>Ministry of Culture (<i>Kultuuriministeerium</i>) as a responsible ministry of integration is conducting regular integration monitoring studies. The studies have been conducted in 2000, 2002, 2005, 2008, 2011 and currently a study is in progress in 2015. The studies use quantitative (population survey) and qualitative methods. In 2016 Ministry of Culture will launch an integration statistics database (<i>lõimumise andmebaas</i>) in cooperation with Statistic Estonia. There based on certain indicators a regular statistics about integration process will be gathered annually. This statistics forms the basis of annual progress report of the Ministry of Culture on integration.</p> <p>The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “Lõimuv Eesti 2020” (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”</i>)<sup>47</sup> includes the following indicators:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The share of people considering themselves to belong to ‘Estonian people’, measured both among the whole population of Estonia as well as among those with foreign background;</li> <li>- The share of people of different ethnic/migrant background with strong or quite strong Estonian national identity;</li> <li>- The difference between Estonians and people of different ethnic/migrant background with regard to participation in third sector organisations;</li> <li>- The share of people with open attitudes according to the tolerance index;</li> <li>- The number of people who have received Estonian citizenship through naturalisation;</li> <li>- The number of people with undefined citizenship;</li> <li>- Youth involvement in youth work in municipalities with a majority population with a mother tongue other than Estonian, compared to the Estonian average;</li> <li>- The frequency of contacts between Estonians and people of different ethnic/migrant background (the percentage of those with lots of contacts).</li> </ul>
	Provide full wording and translation in English of each indicator used per area and dimension covered as well as its full definition, legal basis, rationale, and link with fundamental rights or EU law <b>(use table in the Annex 4)</b> .	
	Please provide data and evidence about	The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “Lõimuv Eesti 2020” ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”</i> ) <sup>48</sup>

<sup>47</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “Lõimuv Eesti 2020” (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)

<sup>48</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “Lõimuv Eesti 2020” (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)

	<p>the adoption of related Zaragoza indicators, especially in the dimensions of active citizenship and welcoming society. Please consult the publication <a href="#">Using EU Indicators of Immigrant Integration</a> (ESN, MPG) and report more detailed and updated specific descriptions and mapping of indicators used in the Member States.</p>	<p>includes some, but not all Zaragoza indicators. Specifically the following indicators are adopted in Estonian national strategy:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Employment: employment rate, unemployment rate.</li> <li>- Education: early school leaving, low achievers, language skills of non-native speakers.</li> <li>- Social inclusion: <i>no indicators</i>.</li> <li>- Active citizenship: naturalisation rate.</li> <li>- Welcoming society: sense of belonging (2 indicators).</li> </ul> <p>However, many of the Zaragoza indicators of active citizenship and welcoming society are included in the integration monitoring surveys conducted by the Ministry of Culture (<i>Kultuuriministeerium</i>) on a regular basis every three years, namely 'voter turnout,' 'perceived experience of discrimination' and 'trust in public institutions.' Share of long-term residence indicator is gathered regularly in administrative statistics. So all three indicators of welcoming society and three out of four indicators of active citizenship are monitored in Estonia.</p> <p>Among the proposed new indicators by the study "Using EU Indicators of Immigrant Integration" no indicators have been adopted into the national integration strategy. However, many indicators from active citizenship and welcoming society are included in the integration monitoring surveys conducted by the Ministry of Culture (<i>Kultuuriministeerium</i>) on a regular basis every three years, namely 'participation in voluntary organisations,' 'political activity,' 'perception of racial/ethnic discrimination' and 'public attitudes to political leader with ethnic minority background.'</p>
--	--	--

### 1.2.5. Funding integration policies (EIF, ERF, EMIF)

	<p>Please provide information about the distribution of funds for integration of migrants, as well as their social inclusion and participation. In particular, provide specific breakdown of funding per general area of integration policies – with particular focus on active citizenship, participation, welcoming society, social cohesion - in the</p>	<p>Data for 2014 is not yet available.<sup>49</sup> Data is not gathered based on the breakdown provided in Annex 5.</p> <p>The distribution of funds of European Integration Fund for Third Country Nationals according to the Estonian national framework is as follows:<sup>50</sup></p> <p>2010: Total funds allocated: €928,160.60 out of which own funds: €309,386.87. Funds divided between the measures as follows: Implementation of actions designed to put the „Common Basic Principles for immigrant integration policy in the European Union" into practice: €1,224,765.14 " Policy capacity building, coordination and intercultural competence building in the Member States across the different levels and departments of government" implementation: €12,782.33</p> <p>2011: Total funds allocated: €962,830.64 out of which own funds: €320,943.55. Funds divided between the measures as follows: Promoting the educational and cultural integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs): €860,860 Supporting the creation of a common media field for Estonian citizens and Third Country Nationals €505,130 Seminar „The Role of Culture in the Integration Process" : €31,960.45</p> <p>2012: Total funds allocated: €1,191,184.41 out of which own funds: €397,061.47. Funds divided between the measures as follows: Supporting the integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs) in Estonia: €686,000. Funds divided between the measures as follows: Data gathering, analyzing and planning activities and services directed to TCNs living in Estonia: €209,956 Supporting the</p>
--	---	--

<sup>49</sup> Estonia, Estonian Ministry of the Interior (*Siseministeerium*) (2015), E-mail correspondence 7 January 2015.

<sup>50</sup> Estonia, Estonian Ministry of the Interior (*Siseministeerium*) (2015), E-mail correspondence 28 January 2015.

<p>last year and for the period 2010-2014 if available. (Use the table in the Annex 5).</p>	<p>development of media and information fields, which would support the integration of TCNs: €647,000 Additional training for organising Estonian language learning in Estonian language based educational institutions for TCNs: €35,000 Organising training seminars and educational visits for organisations involved with integration: €36,067.68</p> <p>2013: Total funds allocated: €1 281,854.22 out of which own funds: €427,284.74 Supporting the integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs) in Estonia: € 807,438 Supporting the development of media and information fields, which would support the integration of TCNs: €819,219 Additional training for organising Estonian language learning in Estonian language based educational institutions for TCNs: €24,895 Organising training seminars and educational visits for organisations involved with integration: € 94,000</p> <p>The distribution of funds of European Refugee Fund according to the Estonian national framework is as follows (without technical assistance):</p> <p>2010: Total funds allocated: €485,683.12 out of which own funds: €121,420.82. Funds divided between the measures as follows:</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/ (projects focusing on offering legal assistance to asylum seekers, training officials, IT-development): €79,737.63</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/international co-operation (projects focusing on sharing best practices in order to improve asylum procedures): €42,599.39</p> <p>Readiness for massive influx of refugees (projects focusing on collaboration between administrations in order to enhance capability to face massive influx): €120,923.33</p> <p>Improvement of asylum seekers reception conditions (projects focusing on helping asylum seekers and beneficiaries of international protection in new social environment: support person service, psychological and social counselling, cultural orientation trainings, recreation events, etc): €97,099.69</p> <p>Awareness of the general public (information campaigns, seminars to raise awareness of the society about asylum issues): €72,751.57</p> <p>2011: Total funds allocated: €495,626.06 out of which own funds: €123,906.54. Funds divided between the measures as follows:</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/ (projects focusing on offering legal assistance to asylum seekers, training officials, IT-development): €102,908.94</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/international co-operation (projects focusing on sharing best practices in order to improve asylum procedures): €16,793.31</p> <p>Studies for mapping and evaluating asylum related services, people's attitudes to give input for policy makers: €27,760.00</p> <p>Improvement of asylum seekers reception conditions (projects focusing on helping asylum seekers and beneficiaries of international protection in new social environment: support person service, psychological and social counselling, cultural orientation trainings, recreation events, etc): €144,414.47</p> <p>Awareness of the general public (information campaigns, seminars to raise awareness of the society about asylum issues): €124,524.51</p> <p>2012: Total funds allocated: €442,438.07 out of which own funds: €110,609.54. Funds divided between the measures as follows:</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/international co-operation (projects focusing on sharing best practices in order to improve asylum procedures): €157,346.25</p>
---	---

		<p>Studies for mapping and evaluating asylum related services, people's attitudes to give input for policy makers: €20,049.00</p> <p>Improvement of asylum seekers reception conditions (projects focusing on helping asylum seekers and beneficiaries of international protection in new social environment: support person service, psychological and social counselling, cultural orientation trainings, recreation events, etc): €25,774.11</p> <p>Awareness of the general public (information campaigns, seminars to raise awareness of the society about asylum issues): €113,910.65</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/ (projects focusing on offering legal assistance to asylum seekers, training officials, IT-development): €58,204.67</p> <p>2013<sup>51</sup>: Total funds allocated: €536,881.86 out of which own funds: €134,220.47. Funds divided between the measures as follows:</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/ (projects focusing on offering legal assistance to asylum seekers, training officials, IT-development): €360,272.92</p> <p>Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/international co-operation (projects focusing on sharing best practices in order to improve asylum procedures): €25,000.00</p> <p>Improvement of asylum seekers reception conditions (projects focusing on helping asylum seekers and beneficiaries of international protection in new social environment: support person service, psychological and social counselling, cultural orientation trainings, recreation events, etc): €219,774.34</p> <p>Awareness of the general public (information campaigns, seminars to raise awareness of the society about asylum issues): €7000.00</p>
--	--	---

## 2.Promoting equal treatment and non-discrimination

### 2.1.The implementation of anti-discrimination legislation and equal treatment

	Briefly provide information on the following:	
	Outreach and awareness raising campaigns, training schemes, etc. undertaken by national or regional public authorities (including national equality bodies) targeting	<p>There have been no outreach and awareness raising campaigns undertaken by national or regional public authorities in Estonia in recent years. The awareness campaigns and trainings have been mostly implemented on project-basis by NGOs, sometimes funded by the government.</p> <p>The most visible awareness raising campaign is called "Diversity enriches" (<i>Erinevus rikastab</i>). Its aim is to promote diversity (sexual, cultural, ethnic etc.), raise awareness and prevent discrimination. The campaign is supported by the Estonian Ministry of Social Affairs (<i>Sotsiaalministeerium</i>) via the European Union programme "PROGRESS" (2007-2013). It is implemented by the Human Rights Centre (<i>Eesti Inimõiguste Keskus</i>), and Tallinn Technical University (<i>Tallinna Tehnikaülikool</i>).<sup>52</sup> The project started in 2010 and is</p>

<sup>51</sup> Committed at the level of the MS

<sup>52</sup> Estonia, Diversity Enriches (*Erinevus rikastab*) webpage. Available at: <http://www.erinevusrikastab.ee/en/>

<p>migrants and their descendants on the national anti-discrimination legal framework.</p>		<p>ongoing. The focus in 2010 was on racism and homophobia, in 2011 on homophobia and the rights of the disabled, in 2012 on gender equality in the business sector, homophobia and discrimination of the elderly, in 2013 the focus was on equal treatment and discrimination in general, and in 2014 again on the rights of the disabled, equal treatment in enterprises and LGBT rights. Thus in sum the project has not focused exclusively on ethnic/racial/linguistic discrimination, however, it has put the value on equality principle in general. Activities organised in the framework of this project have been as follows: seminars and conferences, training for public service officials and business sector personnel, the general public and vulnerable groups, expositions, TV-shows, pamphlets, film showings and research papers.</p> <p>Estonian Human Rights Centre (<i>Eesti Inimõiguste Keskus</i>) has conducted a project "Awareness raising on international forced migration" from 2012-2013, which aimed to raise awareness of the general public about refugees, asylum seekers, persons with subsidiary or temporary protection and victims of human trafficking.<sup>53</sup></p> <p>Starting from 2013 Estonian Human Rights Centre is carrying out a networking project Equal Treatment Network. The main goal of the project is to advance the principle of equal treatment and increase the effectiveness of protection from discrimination through network based strategic advocacy activities and cooperation among NGOs. Through the project awareness about the equal treatment will be raised among NGOs and policymakers, which brings about mainstreaming of the equal treatment principle into policies and legal acts. Additionally, the equal treatment network will document different discrimination cases and according to that information will give input for changing Equal Treatment Act (<i>Võrdse kohtlemise seadus</i>). Expected beneficiaries of the project are disabled people, women, youth, sexual minorities, and ethnic/migrant groups. The project is supported by the NGO Fund of EEA Grants, which is operated by Open Estonia Foundation.<sup>54</sup></p>
<p>Evidence through polls, surveys, academic research, etc. on the awareness of migrants and/or their descendants concerning the right to equal treatment. Please indicate differences between ethnic/</p>		<p>According to the study conducted by the Institute of Baltic Studies (<i>Balti Uuringute Instituut</i>) in 2014 migrants are aware of their rights to be treated equally, however they do not always receive the necessary information on how to execute these rights. The main barriers to access to information include: language (more information in Estonian than in English, some legal forms provided in Estonian and Russian only, but not in English) and lack of suitable information for migrant's needs.<sup>55</sup> This study was qualitative and does not allow indicating differences between migrant groups.</p> <p>According to the Integration monitoring study 20% of ethnic minorities have declared that they have experienced unequal treatment. Important characteristic in perception of unequal treatment is citizenship – among people with undetermined</p>

<sup>53</sup> Estonian Human Rights Centre (*Eesti Inimõiguste Keskus*) webpage. Available at: <http://humanrights.ee/en/refugees/awareness-raising-on-international-forced-migration/>

<sup>54</sup> Estonian Human Rights Centre (*Eesti Inimõiguste Keskus*) webpage. Available at: <http://humanrights.ee/en/equal-treatment/4071-2/>

<sup>55</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*) (2014). Newly-arrived immigrants in Estonia: Policy Options and Recommendations for a Comprehensive and Sustainable Support System (*Uussisserändajate kohanemine Eestis: valikud ja poliitikaettepanekud tervikliku ja jätkusuutliku süsteemi kujundamiseks*). Available at: <https://www.riigikantselei.ee/valitsus/valitsus/et/riigikantselei/strateegia/poliitika-analuusid-ja-uuringud/tarkade-otsuste-fondi-uuringute-kokkuvotted/TOF%20-%20uussisser%C3%A4ndajad%20-%20201%C3%B5puaruanne.pdf>



<p>migrant groups, living in different geographic areas, gender and age, as well as trends in time.</p>	<p>citizenship there are twice more respondents who have experienced unequal treatment compared to people with Estonian or Russian Federation citizenship who are of ethnic minority decent. Interestingly people of ethnic minority decent with higher education reported having experienced unequal treatment more often than people with lower educational qualifications.<sup>56</sup></p> <p>According to the most recent (report forthcoming) Integration Monitoring Survey 2015, 4% of ethnic Estonians and 12% other nationalities claimed that they have experienced unequal treatment based on nationality or mother tongue in the hiring or promoting in the workplace in last years. Further 17% of ethnic Estonians and 35% of other nationalities have not personally experienced, but have heard of the cases of unequal treatment.<sup>57</sup></p> <p>According to the study Equal Treatment in Estonia: Awareness and Promotion (<i>Võrdse kohtlemise edendamise ja teadlikkus Eestis</i>),<sup>58</sup> among Estonians there are more individuals who are not interested in equal treatment topics and feel reluctant about the topic. Amongst Russians (people who consider themselves to be ethnically Russian), on the other hand, there are more of those who are actively interested and who are following discussions about ET in Estonia and globally. With regard to the knowledge concerning the Equal Treatment Act (<i>Võrdse kohtlemise seadus</i>)<sup>59</sup> 29% of Estonians neither know nor are interested in the Act and its effects while minorities (naturalised Russians and Russians with Russian citizenship) are somewhat more interested in the regulations and the effectiveness of the Act. Among Russians with Estonian citizenship and Russians with Russian citizenship, the rate of those not interested reached 15-16%. However, according to the study Russian citizens and those with undetermined citizenship exhibit the greatest uncertainty or lack of knowledge with regard to awareness of what to do in case of discrimination. Thus, the study revealed that the majority population has no interest and incentives to concern themselves with equal treatment issues while the minorities feel that they do not have enough knowledge about the equal treatment principles and methods of protection against unequal treatment.</p>
<p>Evidence of complaints lodged by migrants and/or their descendants - % of total complaints to equality bodies,</p>	<p>Only one complaint on racial or ethnic discrimination was received by labour dispute committees (<i>Töövaidluskomisjon</i>) of Labour Inspectorate during the period 1 January 2014 – 31 December 2014. The complaint was not satisfied on the basis of discrimination.<sup>60</sup></p> <p>Information about the complaints lodged by people on the basis of nationality or ethnicity to the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (<i>Võrdõigusvolinik</i>) was provided as follows: there were seven complaints in 2013, out of which four were lodged by male,</p>

<sup>56</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>57</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring Survey 2015 (*Eesti ühiskonna integratsiooni monitooring 2015*), Ministry of Culture, Institute of Baltic Studies (report forthcoming).

<sup>58</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*) (2013). Equal Treatment in Estonia: Awareness and Promotion (*Võrdse kohtlemise edendamise ja teadlikkus Eestis*). Available at: [http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20\(2013\)%20-%20EN.pdf](http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20(2013)%20-%20EN.pdf)

<sup>59</sup> Estonia, Equal Treatment Act (*Võrdse kohtlemise seadus*), RT I 2008, 56, 315. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/530102013066/consolide>

<sup>60</sup> Estonia, Labour Inspectorate (*Tööinspeksioon*). E-mail correspondence with Ms Eda Kidra, Financial and Administrative Department, 13 March 2015.

<p>% of admissible complaints, statistics about outcomes of investigation, % of cases establishing discrimination. Please indicate differences between ethnic/migrant groups, geographic areas, gender and age, as well as trends in time.</p>	<p>two by female and one by a legal person in public law. All of the complaints were related to ethnic and/or racial issues. There was one successful mediation and restoration of rights/fairness, one establishment of discrimination, two unsuccessful mediations and three formally non-admissible and withdrawn accounts.<sup>61</sup></p>
<p>Tools, measures and positive initiatives aiming at facilitating reporting incidents of discrimination – e.g. translation facilities to report and submit complaints in multiple languages – and tackling under-reporting and low rights-awareness.</p>	<p>The institution of the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner has been created in order to help people protect their rights and to avoid any form of discrimination. The institution was created with the adoption of the Gender Equality Act<sup>62</sup> in 2004 .The Commissioner stands up for women and men having equal rights and opportunities in all aspects of public life. The Commissioner also endeavours to ensure that people in various minority groups are not treated unequally. Information provided by the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (<i>Võrdõigusvolinik</i>) indicates that no lodged complaints have been connected to language problems or barriers between migrants and/or people with a migrant background and government institutions. She emphasises that relevant information is available in English. Furthermore, commissioner’s main aim is to tackle under-reporting as well as ensure rights-awareness.<sup>63</sup></p>
<p>In particular, provide information about any legal protection on grounds of nationality, which is not covered by the EU anti-discrimination Directives, but is a prohibited</p>	<p>Equal Treatment Act (<i>Võrdõiguslikkuse seadus</i>) provides protection of persons against discrimination on grounds of nationality (ethnic origin).<sup>64</sup> Discrimination of persons on grounds of nationality (ethnic origin) is prohibited in the areas of employment (upon establishment of conditions for access to employment, to self-employment or to occupation, including selection criteria and recruitment conditions, as well as upon promotion; entry into employment contracts or contracts for the provision of services, appointment or election to office, establishment of working conditions, giving instructions, remuneration, termination or cancellation of employment contracts or contracts for the provision of services, release from office); access to vocational guidance, vocational training, advanced vocational training and retraining, practical work experience; and membership</p>

<sup>61</sup> Estonia, Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (*Võrdõigusvolinik*), E.mail correspondence with Ms Mari-Liis Sepper, 31 March 2015.

<sup>62</sup> Estonia, Gender Equality Act (*Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse seadus*), RT I 2004, 27, 181. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/530102013038/consolide>

<sup>63</sup> Estonia, Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (*Võrdõigusvolinik*), E.mail correspondence with Ms Mari-Liis Sepper, 31 March 2015.

<sup>64</sup> Estonia, Equal Treatment Act (*Võrdse kohtlemise seadus*), § 1 (1). RT I 2008, 56, 315. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/530102013066/consolide>



<p>ground in several Member States. Please explain how unequal treatment on the basis of nationality is treated and provide exemplary cases, if any. Please provide information on the relevant practice and case law <b>(use template in Annex 9)</b></p>	<p>in an organisation of employees or employers, including a professional organisation, and grant of benefits by such organisations; access to the services of social welfare, social security and healthcare, including social benefits; education; and access to and supply of goods and services which are available to the public, including housing.<sup>65</sup></p> <p>In 2012 Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (<i>Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise volinik</i>) issued two opinions on investigations that were initiated based on the complaints received and regarded as unequal treatment on the grounds of nationality (ethnic background). One of them regarded discrimination during the recruitment process for a job and another one regarded creating better working conditions. The latter case was decided by the Commissioner on 30 August 2012. The complainant claimed being discriminated at work due to her ethnic background. Having worked for the company for many years and being highly assessed specialist she was refused in several occasions to be transferred to another department where the conditions of work were better and salary higher. According to complainant all the people working for this department were ethnic Estonians, many of them had no experience of work at all. The complainant applied to be transferred to this department several times, but was refused without any explanations. The department where the claimant was working was transferred to the shift-work system, which was not possible for her due to child-care obligations. She was offered another position with lower salary. She again asked to be transferred to the new department that did not have shift-work system, however was refused and as a result had to terminate her employment. The Commissioner found that the employer used discriminatory approach when recruiting people to the new department as it failed to prove the opposite.<sup>66</sup></p> <p>The case regarding the discrimination based on nationality in recruitment process is provided in more detail in Annex 9.</p>
<p>Please provide information about the application of the legislation concerning discrimination against migrants – on any ground – in accessing law enforcement and judiciary services. In particular please clarify whether and when the</p>	<p>During the control visit of the Chancellor of Justice (<i>Õiguskantsler</i>) in 2010 to the Estonian refugee reception centre, the Chancellor pointed out that there exist some deficiencies with regard to refugees' access to information about their rights and obligations. According to the Chancellor this might result in the abuse of refugees' rights.<sup>67</sup></p>

<sup>65</sup> Estonia, Equal Treatment Act (*Võrdse kohtlemise seadus*), § 2 (1). RT I 2008, 56, 315. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/530102013066/consolide>

<sup>66</sup> Estonia, Tarbija 24 (2012) 'Volinik: Instrumentaarium eelistas tölevõtmisel eestlasi', 30 August 2012.

<sup>67</sup> Estonia, Chancellor of Justice (*Õiguskantsler*) Control Visit to the Illuka Refugee Reception Centre (*Kontrollkäik Illuka Varjupaigataotlejate Vastuvõtukeskusesse*) (2010). Available at: [http://oiguskantsler.ee/sites/default/files/field\\_document2/kontrollkaigu\\_kokkuvote\\_illuka\\_varjupaigataotlejate\\_vastuvotukeskuses.pdf](http://oiguskantsler.ee/sites/default/files/field_document2/kontrollkaigu_kokkuvote_illuka_varjupaigataotlejate_vastuvotukeskuses.pdf)

<p>latter are considered and treated, or not, as services available to the public, therefore falling within the scope of the directives and the jurisdiction of Equality Bodies.</p>	
<p>Please provide statistical data about numbers of discrimination cases/complaints submitted to competent bodies (Equality Bodies, Administrative Courts), as well as about their outcomes <b>(use the tables in the Annex 8)</b></p>	
<h2>2.2.Implementation of equal treatment of various permit holders</h2>	
<p>Please summarize <u>briefly</u> in this section any key issues affecting the implementation of equal treatment of permit holders, as defined by the following EU legislation; these could be, for example, practical issues and bottlenecks, administrative delays, coordination and cooperation of public authorities, etc. Please substantiate findings, as far as possible, through formal evaluations, as well as research or studies and case law <b>(use template in Annex 9)</b>. Please bear in mind that no assessment of the <b>legal transposition</b> process is required. In regard to the five categories below, please provide <u>statistical data</u> issued in 2014 or valid on 31.12.14. <b>(use annex 3)</b></p>	
<p>2.2.1.<u>Long Term Residence</u> (LTR) status holders (Art.11 of the Directive <a href="#">2003/109/EC</a>)</p>	<p>No key issues have been identified. There have been no reports pointing to the problems with the implementation of equal treatment of long term residence permit holders. Desk research has been carried out for the reports.  Number of valid LTR permits as of 31 December 2014: 171,131<sup>68</sup></p>
<p>2.2.2.<u>Single-Single-permit procedure</u> permit holders (Art.12 and 13 of the Directive <a href="#">2011/98/EU</a>)</p>	<p>Short-term residence permit holders may face the problem of claiming unemployment benefits due to the time requirement imposed for qualifying for benefits. According to the Unemployment Insurance Act (<i>Töötuskindlustuse seadus</i>) §6 (2) right to receive unemployment insurance benefit appears to a worker if his/her unemployment insurance period is at least twelve months during the thirty-six months prior to registration as unemployed.<sup>69</sup> From this stems that those permit holders who have been employed and paid unemployment insurance for less than 12 month prior to registering their unemployment do not qualify for unemployment benefit.  Number of valid single permit procedure permit holders as of 31 December 2014: 25,136</p>
<p>2.2.3.<u>Blue card</u> holders (Art.14 and 12 of the Directive <a href="#">2009/50/EC</a>)</p>	<p>The same problems arise for Blue card holders as for single permit holders (see point 2.2.2). Number of valid Blue card holders as of 31 December 2014: 38</p>

<sup>68</sup> Estonia, Police and Border Guard Board (*Politse- ja Piirivalveamet*). E-mail correspondence 23 February 2015.

<sup>69</sup> Estonia, Unemployment Insurance Act (*Töötuskindlustuse seadus*), RT I 2001, 59, 359. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/509072014020/consolide>

2.2.4. Family reunification permit holders (specifically in terms of access to labour market - Art. 14 of	No key issues have been identified. There have been no reports pointing to the problems with the implementation of equal treatment of family reunification permit holders. Desk research has been carried out for the reports.  Number of valid family reunification permit holders as of 31 December 2014: 6837
2.2.5. Beneficiaries of international protection long term residence status holders	Beneficiaries of international protection do not receive long term residence status in Estonia – they receive a 3-year living and working permit that can be extended unlimited times. <sup>70</sup> They are entitled to long-term residence permit once the requirements of legal residency (5 years) and other conditions set in the Aliens Act ( <i>Välismaalaste seadus</i> ) are met. The number of beneficiaries of international protection as of 31 December 2014 is 64.

## 2.3. Key developments and trends

	<p>Please include in this section key developments in the area of equal treatment and anti-discrimination that concern only migrants and/or their descendants. Key developments may be new legislation or policies, abolition, update, improvement or reform of existing ones, as well as important case law, court, equality body or administrative cases, that have had or may have an impact on the</p>	<p>There have been no key developments in the area of equal treatment and anti-discrimination that concern migrants or their descendants.</p> <p>According to the research report published in 2013 unequal treatment is experienced by Russian-speakers (30% of respondents think that people with Russian origins experience intolerance, 16% think the same about other ethnic groups, and 6% perceives intolerance towards new immigrants – including e.g. Asians).<sup>71</sup> Discrimination on the ground of ethnic or racial origin is most evident in the employment sector - 20% of survey respondents have reported on experienced unequal treatment during the recruitment process and career promotion.<sup>72</sup></p> <p>Despite of the perceived discrimination based on ethnic origin there have been no major policy responses in recent years. The Russian-speaking population is among the most vulnerable groups in the context of employment. This is reflected in the high unemployment rate of Russians compared to Estonians. The situation is mainly due to the lack of knowledge of the Estonian language, structural problems of the Estonian labour market (i.e. the skills and qualifications of the employees do not correspond to the demands of the labour market), historical conflict between the ethnic groups that creates prejudice and stereotypes, and the lack of Estonian citizenship among some Russian-speakers which is a prerequisite for certain jobs (e.g. in public service). There is also a risk of multiple discrimination e.g. lack of language skills and of citizenship.<sup>73</sup> Despite of these barriers the Labour Market Services and Benefits Act (<i>Tööturuteenuste ja -toetuste seadus</i>)<sup>74</sup> does not mention the Russian-speaking population among the vulnerable groups requiring</p>
--	--	---

<sup>70</sup> Estonia, Police and Border Guard Board (*Politse- ja Piirivalveamet*). Available at: <https://www.politsei.ee/en/>

<sup>71</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*) (2013). Equal Treatment in Estonia: Awareness and Promotion (*Võrdse kohtlemise edendamise ja teadlikkus Eestis*). Available at: [http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20\(2013\)%20-%20EN.pdf](http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20(2013)%20-%20EN.pdf)

<sup>72</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>73</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>74</sup> Estonia, Labour Market Services and Benefits Act (*Tööturuteenuste ja -toetuste seadus*). RT I 2005, 54, 430. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/506062014001/consolide/current>

<p>implementation of the anti-discrimination legislation and equal treatment policies that related to the rights of migrants and/or their descendants <b>(for presentation of case law, use template in Annex 9)</b>. Such developments may also affect the actual situation on the ground, including public debates and perceptions among the native population and migrants.</p>	<p>special measures for equal participation in the labour market such as intensive language learning. The main development is the adoption of the Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>)<sup>75</sup> however, the strategy mentions equal treatment only in general terms and does not include any specific measure (yet) to target the issues of anti-discrimination and equal treatment based on ethnic/migrant background.</p>
--	---

## 3. Participation of migrants and their descendants in society

### 3.1. Political rights at national level

#### 3.1.1. Citizenship acquisition

	<p>In this section please provide information about the specific requirements and criteria for citizenship acquisition, if any, that relate to the applicants active participation in society, genuine links or bond to the society or the country, schooling period or other 'socialization' requirements. -Path to citizenship for foreign born third country nationals (the so-called '1st generation')</p>	
	<p>Please provide information about the specific requirements and criteria for citizenship acquisition, if any, that relate to the applicants active participation in society, genuine links or bond to the society or the country, schooling period or other 'socialization' requirements. - Path to citizenship for country-born</p>	<p>Estonian Citizenship Act (<i>Kodakondsuse seadus</i>) §6 6) requires among other requirements, such as the length of residence of five years prior to the application and at least six months after the application, an applicant for citizenship to be "loyal to the Estonian state" and 7) requires to take an oath <i>Taotledes Eesti kodakondsust, tõotan olla ustav Eesti</i></p>

<sup>75</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)

	<p>(so-called '2nd generation') and country-grown migrant children (so-called '1,5 generation')</p>	<p><i>põhiseaduslikule korrale</i>. [In applying for Estonian citizenship, I swear to be loyal to the constitutional order of Estonia.].<sup>76</sup> For those '1st generation' migrants who have received education in Estonia in Estonian language are exempt from taking the language proficiency test required by the law. The level required by the law is B1.<sup>77</sup></p> <p>Estonian Citizenship Act does not provide paths to citizenship for country-born migrant children with one exception. A minor under 15 years of age who was born in Estonia after 26 February 1992 is granted Estonian citizenship by naturalisation if his or her parents apply for Estonian citizenship on his or her behalf, provided the parents have lawfully resided in Estonia for at least five years at the time of submission of the application and are not recognised by any other state to be citizens of that state in accordance with the legislation in force.<sup>78</sup> According to the changes adopted in January 2015 and coming into force in January 2016 it is no longer expected from the parents (or a parent) to apply for Estonian citizenship, but the child will be granted citizenship at birth unless the parents express their will not to receive the citizenship within the year after the birth of the child.<sup>79</sup></p>
	<p>Debates, issues and challenges concerning the implementation of citizenship policies</p>	<p>One of the widely discussed issues of the Estonian citizenship policy is its denial of automatic citizenship rights to the former Soviet Union citizens who were not able to prove their descent from the citizens of the first Estonian Republic (1918-1930) and who did not apply for Estonian citizenship via naturalisation after the collapse of the Soviet Union. After their Soviet passports were announced invalid, some of these people have acquired Russian citizenship and some have remained stateless and are officially defined as "people with undetermined citizenship". Currently there are 84,494 persons with undetermined citizenship residing in Estonia.<sup>80</sup> In January 2015 the Parliament adopted the</p>

<sup>76</sup> Estonia, Citizenship Act (*Kodakondsuse seadus*), RT I 1995, 12, 122. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/512022015001/consolide>

<sup>77</sup> Estonia, Citizenship Act (*Kodakondsuse seadus*), § 8 (5). RT I 1995, 12, 122. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/512022015001/consolide>

<sup>78</sup> Estonia, Citizenship Act (*Kodakondsuse seadus*), § 13 (4). RT I 1995, 12, 122. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/512022015001/consolide>

<sup>79</sup> Estonia, Act Changing Citizenship Act and State Fees Act (*Kodakondsuse seaduse ja riigilõivu seaduse muutmise seadus*), RT I, 03.02.2015, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/103022015001>

<sup>80</sup> Estonia, 2011 Census data. Available at: [www.stat.ee](http://www.stat.ee)

		<p>amendments to the Citizenship Act that will grant automatic citizenship to children who would otherwise remain with undetermined citizenship (see above). However, this concerns approximately 900 children. The large proportion of people with undetermined citizenship are adults whose main barriers in gaining citizenship is lack of sufficient knowledge of Estonian language.<sup>81</sup></p> <p>The second issue concerns the lack of path to citizenship for country-born (so-called '2nd generation'). This option has not been widely debated though, however international observers have pointed to the need to solve the problem of large number of persons with undetermined citizenship as well as Russian citizens.</p> <p>The third issue concerns the §1 and §3 in Citizenship Act that prevent multiple citizenships. While Estonian citizens that had acquired their citizenship at birth and were or became later in life also citizens of other country or countries, shall according to §3 renounce either his or her Estonian citizenship or his or her citizenship of the other state within three years after attaining the age of 18 years, the persons who acquired Estonian citizenship by naturalisation were forced to denounce their previous citizenships prior to applying to Estonian citizenship. With the amendments to the Act adopted in January 2015 this situation was changed and accordingly also naturalised citizens can retain their other citizenships until the age of 18 after which they must renounce either his or her Estonian citizenship or his or her citizenship of the other state within three years after attaining the age of 18 years. Amendments come to force in 1 January 2016.<sup>82</sup></p>
	<p>Key developments and trends – case law (<b>please use the template in the Annex 9</b> to provide information about the cases – here only a simple reference to the case name is required) or new provisions and reforms.</p>	<p>There is no case law related to citizenship acquisition. New provisions and reforms are provided in the following section.</p>
	<p>Please indicate key and/or milestone dates – e.g. of major</p>	<p>In January 2016 new changes to the Citizenship Act (<i>Kodakondsuse seadus</i>) will</p>

<sup>81</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>82</sup> Estonia, Act Changing Citizenship Act and State Fees Act (*Kodakondsuse seaduse ja riigilõivu seaduse muutmise seadus*), RT I, 03.02.2015, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/103022015001>



	<p>reforms - regarding citizenship acquisition for migrants and/or their descendants.</p>	<p>come into force that will grant automatic citizenship to children born in Estonia or outside of Estonia but who became residents of Estonia right after the birth and who would otherwise remain stateless (with undetermined citizenship), unless parents express their will not to receive the citizenship within the year after the birth of the child.<sup>83</sup></p> <p>In January 2016 new changes to the Citizenship Act (<i>Kodakondsuse seadus</i>) will come into force that will allow a minor who hold Estonian citizenship, either by birth or via naturalisation to retain multiple citizenships until the age of 18.<sup>84</sup></p>
	<p>Naturalisation rate - % of migrants that have been naturalized compared to migrant stock and to general population – listing the most numerous groups on the basis of their previous nationality, by gender and age-group if available. <b><u>Please provide the latest available data.</u></b> The most recent data provided by <u>Eurostat</u> concern the year 2012.</p>	<p>1,608 persons naturalised in Estonia in 2014. Estonia does not calculate the naturalisation rate in the official statistics as it is not clear from what figure to measure the rate. At the beginning of 2014, 22,564 persons had a valid short-term residence permit, 174,873 had a long-term residence permit, 151 persons had a registered residence permit of the family member of the European Union citizen and 58 had the permanent residence permit of a family member (total 197,646 persons with valid residence permits).</p> <p>Out of all naturalised persons in 2014 1,360 had previously had undetermined citizenship (85%), 199 had Russian citizenship, 30 had Ukrainian citizenship, 4 had Pakistani citizenship, 3 had Latvian citizenship, 3 had Belarusian citizenship, 2 had Kazakhstani citizenship, 2 Indian citizenship, 1 Chinese citizenship, 1 Moldovan citizenship, 1 Georgian citizenship, 1 Turkish citizenship, and 1 had Swedish citizenship.</p> <p>Age groups can be defined as follows: 0-17 : 515 persons naturalised; 18-24: 255 persons naturalised; 25-39: 566 persons naturalised; 40-54: 209 persons naturalised; 55+ : 63 persons naturalised. 727 of the naturalised were men and 881 women.<sup>85</sup></p>
<p>Numbers of naturalisations and citizenship acquisitions in the last 2 years (in 2013 and in 2014) by mode of acquisition, by gender and age-group if available, and for the 10 most numerous groups on the basis of their previous nationality <i>Please</i></p>		

<sup>83</sup> Estonia, Act Changing Citizenship Act and State Fees Act (*Kodakondsuse seaduse ja riigilõivu seaduse muutmise seadus*), adopted 21.01.2015, RT I, 03.02.2015, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/103022015001>

<sup>84</sup> Estonia, Citizenship Act (*Kodakondsuse seadus*), § 3. RT I 1995, 12, 122. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/512022015001/consolide>

<sup>85</sup> Estonia, Police and Border Guard Board (*Politse- ja Piirivalveamet*). E-mail correspondence 23 February 2015.

	provide the <b>latest available statistics</b> - (please use the relevant table in the <b>Annex 6</b> )
--	---

### 3.1.2. National elections voting rights - turnout

<p>Third country nationals are allowed in exceptional cases to vote in national elections. In this section please provide the specific requirements and criteria for participation of citizens of migrant background (and third country nationals in the very few cases where this is foreseen) in national elections, as well as any available data on their voting turnout. Please specify any differences in different geographic areas or by type of national level voting circumstances (e.g. parliament, referendum, president of the republic etc.). In addition to official data and also if such data are not available, make reference to any relevant quantitative or qualitative academic research concerning the exercise of the right to vote and related drivers and barriers.</p>	<p>According to Riigikogu Election Act (<i>Riigikogu valimise seadus</i>) only Estonian citizens who have attained 18 years of age by election day have the right to vote.<sup>86</sup></p> <p>In March 2015 Riigikogu elections the voter turnout in the areas with high percentage of migrant residence (districts of Tallinn and Ida-Viru county) was lower than the national average. While the average national voter turnout was 64.2%, in Ida-Viru county where Russian-speakers constitute 80% of residents the voter turnout was 55%, in Lasnamäe (part of Tallinn with a high percentage of Russian-speakers) the voter turnout was 51.4%.<sup>87</sup></p> <p>According to the Integration Monitoring survey 2011 (<i>Integratsiooni monitooring 2011</i>)<sup>88</sup> the political activity rate of ethnic/migrant minorities in different Estonian regions varies. Political activity rates have been calculated based on election turnouts, petitioning, participation in political meetings, participation in online political discussions or campaigns, not taking part in elections for protest reasons, communicating with politicians and presenting them personal ideas, wearing badges, stickers or ribbons with political messages and taking part in protests. According to the survey the political activity rate of non-citizens and people with undetermined citizenship is generally lower than the political activity rates of Estonian citizens (regardless of their ethnicity). It is the lowest in Ida-Virumaa region, where as many as 83% of respondents' political activeness may be assessed as very low. In Tallinn (except Lasnamäe) 27% of respondents' activeness is high, but 58%'s activeness should be still assessed as very low. The political activeness of ethnic/migrant minorities is higher in the city of Maardu and the Tallinn's district of Lasnamäe: 27% of respondents are very</p>
---	--

<sup>86</sup> Estonia, Riigikogu Election Act (*Riigikogu valimise seadus*) § 4. RT I 2002, 57, 355. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/514112013015/consolide/current>

<sup>87</sup> Estonia, statistics of National Electoral Committee (*Vabariigi Valimiskomisjon*), as of 23 March 2015. Available at: <http://rk2015.vvk.ee/detailed.html>

<sup>88</sup> Estonia, Integration monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Ministry of Culture, Policy Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)



		active; however, still 50% of respondents' activeness is low.
	Please indicate any programmes or information campaigns aiming at informing citizens of migrant background about their political rights and encouraging the exercise of the right to vote.	No such campaigns have been implemented. Voting encouragement campaigns implemented by the National Electoral Committee ( <i>Vabariigi Valimiskomisjon</i> ) focus on the general population and the organisation of the elections only. According to the National Electoral Committee, they provided multi-language voter cards (invitations to come to vote) before the local level elections in Russian, Finnish, Latvian, Lithuanian, English, German and French, and before the European Parliament elections in Finnish, Latvian, Lithuanian, English, German and French. During national elections, the voter card is always distributed in the Estonian language only. <sup>89</sup>

### 3.1.3. National level election – representation

	The number of <b>candidates</b> with migrant background (where available, specify own or parent's country of birth) at the latest national level elections (specify date)	Data is unavailable and not collected. It is difficult to assess candidates' ethnic background without conducting a survey, which would allow the candidates themselves to identify their linguistic/ethnic/religious background.
	The number of <b>elected representatives</b> with migrant background at national level (e.g. parliament, senate)	Data is unavailable and not collected.
	Those <b>appointed</b> to public office (e.g. ministers, secretaries of state, etc.) by end of 2014.	Data is unavailable and not collected. However, the current Minister of Education and Research Mr Jevgeni Ossinovski a first minister with Russian roots in Estonian cabinet since 1991.

## 3.2. Political rights at regional/local level

### 3.2.1. Regional/Local elections voting rights – turnout

	Specify what regional/local voting rights are given to third country nationals and any different entitlements according to residence status, permit type or length of stay etc	According to the Local Government Council Election Act ( <i>Kohaliku omavalitsuse volikogu valimise seadus</i> ) <sup>90</sup> a citizen of a non-EU Member State or a person with undetermined citizenship residing in Estonia may vote at the local government council elections if he/she resides in Estonia on the basis of a long-term
--	--	---

<sup>89</sup> Estonia, National Electoral Committee (*Vabariigi Valimiskomisjon*). E-mail correspondence with Mr. Priit Vinkel 25 March 2015.

<sup>90</sup> Estonia, Local Government Council Election Act (*Kohaliku omavalitsuse volikogu valimise seadus*), § 5. RT I 2002, 36, 220. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/516032015001/consolide>

	<p>residence permit or the right of permanent residence. He/she cannot stand as candidate to the council.</p> <p>A person must be of at least 18 years of age to vote. In order to vote, a person must have been entered in the list of voters, which means that they must have the address of their residence entered in the population register.<sup>91</sup></p>
Key and/or milestone dates regarding the voting and/or election rights for migrants and/or their descendants at regional/local level	There have been no major developments regarding the local election voting rights and turnouts between 2010-2014.
Please indicate any programmes or information campaigns aiming at informing citizens of migrant background about their political rights and encouraging the exercise of the right to vote.	<p>No such campaigns have been carried out. However, Estonian political parties carry out their election campaigns also in Russian language (translation of election platform, election campaign material, advertisement in Russian language media etc) which might have an impact on increased turnout in elections among the ethnic/migrant minority.</p> <p>There is no big difference in voter turnout in areas with high percentage of migrant residence between the national and local elections, despite of the TCN having the right to vote in local elections. In recent national elections in 2015 the voter turnout in Ida-Virumaa was 55% compared to national average of 64%. In recent local government elections in 2013 the voter turnout in Ida-Virumaa was 52% compared to national average of 58%.<sup>92</sup></p>
In addition to official data and also if such data are not available, make reference to any relevant quantitative or qualitative academic research concerning the exercise of the right to vote and related drivers and barriers.	<p>In 2011 in the research report prepared by the Institute of Baltic Studies (<i>Balti Uuringute Instituut</i>) few recommendations were presented, among them requiring the Government to pay more attention to promoting naturalisation, although it does not always result in risen political participation. The report also argued that TCNs should be given the right to become candidates and be elected on the local government level.<sup>93</sup></p> <p>No statistics is collected regarding the exercise of the right to vote of citizens with migrant background. Based on the election turnout in local elections in 2013 in 3</p>

<sup>91</sup> Estonian Electoral Committee (*Eesti Valimiskomisjon*). Available at: <http://www.vvk.ee/info-for-voters/>

<sup>92</sup> Estonia, statistics of National Electoral Committee (*Vabariigi Valimiskomisjon*), as of 04 May 2015.

<sup>93</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*) (2011), "Overview of Estonia's ethnic minorities' and immigrants' political participation and proposals for its amelioration" ("Ülevaade Eesti etniliste vähemusgruppide ja immigrantide poliitilisest osalusest ning ettepanekud selle suurendamiseks") Available at: [file:///C:/Users/Pille/Downloads/Soovitused\\_olukorra\\_parandamiseks.pdf](file:///C:/Users/Pille/Downloads/Soovitused_olukorra_parandamiseks.pdf)

	largest municipalities where Russian-speakers constitute a majority of population (more than 50%), the turnout in elections in these municipalities is lower than Estonian average: <sup>94</sup> Estonian average: 57.9% Narva (non-Estonians constitute 95% of population): <sup>95</sup> 46.7% Sillamäe (non-Estonians constitute 95% of population): 58.3 % Kohtla-Järve (non-Estonians constitute 84% of population): 47.3%
--	--

### 3.2.2.Regional/local level election – representation

The number of <b>candidates</b> that were third country nationals and/or with migrant background at the latest regional/local level elections (specify date)	According to the Local Government Council Election Act ( <i>Kohaliku omavalitsuse volikogu valimise seadus</i> ) <sup>96</sup> TCN do not have the right to run as a candidate in local elections. Data on the ethnic background of the candidates is unavailable and not collected. It is difficult to assess candidates' ethnic background without conducting a survey, which would allow the candidates themselves to identify their linguistic/ethnic/religious background.
The number and % of <b>elected representatives</b> with migrant background at regional/local level (e.g. municipalities, regions, prefectures etc.)	According to the Local Government Council Election Act ( <i>Kohaliku omavalitsuse volikogu valimise seadus</i> ) <sup>97</sup> TCN do not have the right to run as a candidate in local elections. Data on the ethnic background of the elected representatives is unavailable and not collected. It is difficult to assess candidates' ethnic background without conducting a survey, which would allow the candidates themselves to identify their linguistic/ethnic/religious background.
Those who were <b>elected</b> or <b>appointed</b> to a high public office (e.g. mayor, vice mayor etc.) by end of 2014.	Data on the ethnic background of the elected or appointed public officials is unavailable and not collected. Elected representatives in local level in local governments with the high percentage of Russian speakers are dominantly ethnic Russians or other ethnic minorities (such cities as Sillamäe, Kohtla-Järve, Narva). Accordingly several appointed representatives of these municipalities are

<sup>94</sup> Estonian Electoral Committee (*Eesti Valimiskomisjon*). Available at: <http://kov2013.vvk.ee/detailed.html>

<sup>95</sup> Data about ethnic composition of municipalities is taken from Population Census 2011 database.

<sup>96</sup> Estonia, Local Government Council Election Act (*Kohaliku omavalitsuse volikogu valimise seadus*), § 5. RT I 2002, 36, 220. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/516032015001/consolide>

<sup>97</sup> Estonia, Local Government Council Election Act (*Kohaliku omavalitsuse volikogu valimise seadus*), § 5. RT I 2002, 36, 220. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/516032015001/consolide>

		<p>of migrant/ethnic minority background. Also large number of elected representatives in Tallinn city council have ethnic minority background. Furthermore, several appointed representatives in the Tallinn city administration are of migrant background such as vice-mayor Mihhail Kõlvart in Tallinn.</p>
	<p>Please identify related limitations and challenges or public debates, as well as relevant research, studies and assessments.</p>	<p>The limitations to the appointed public officials to a high public office among citizens of migrant background are related to the language requirements (C1) that are often set for such offices for candidates who have not acquired their education in Estonian language. Similar language requirements for elected representatives were abolished in 2001. According to the Local Government Organisation Act (<i>Kohaliku omavalitsuse korralduse seadus</i>)<sup>98</sup> the mayors and municipality mayors (who are elected by the council and not a popular vote in Estonia) are subjected to regulations concerning the language proficiency. According to the Act only a person who is citizen of the Republic of Estonia and proficient in Estonian to the extent established by law may be elected a rural municipality or city mayor and approved as a member of the government. The number of minority representatives working as public officials in the ministries is indeed very low, as reported by several sectoral representatives in informal discussions. Researchers in their analysis have also pointed to the gaps in representative bureaucracy where the symbolic representation of minority is not existent.<sup>99</sup> There have been no comprehensive studies or other research carried out on the minority representation in public office, except a study that was carried out in 2007 pointed to the gap.<sup>100</sup> Although the issue has not been addressed in national integration strategies or any other legal and political instruments, it has been discussed in seminars and roundtables focusing on integration issues.</p>

<sup>98</sup> Estonia, Local Government Organisation Act (*Kohaliku omavalitsuse korralduse seadus*), § 482 (1). RT I 1993, 37, 558. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/506112013013/consolide>

<sup>99</sup> Estonia, Vetik, R., Ivanov, S. (2014) Symbolic power in Estonian ethnopolitics (*Sümboolne võim Eesti etnoliitikas*). Riigikogu Toimetised 30, 2014. Available at: <http://www.riigikogu.ee/rito/index.php?id=16402>

<sup>100</sup> Estonia, State Integration Programme 2008-2013. Final Report on Needs and Feasibility Research (2008). Integration Foundation. Available at: [http://www.meis.ee/raamatukogu?book\\_id=199](http://www.meis.ee/raamatukogu?book_id=199)

### 3.3.Consultation

#### 3.3.1.Consultative bodies at national/regional/local level

Are there any migrants' consultative bodies in place at national / regional/ local level foreseen and/or operational in practice? Since when and on which legal basis (please provide reference). Please specify whether migrants' consultative/advisory/representative bodies are established by law or other type of normative regulation, policy or practice.

There are no migrant's consultative bodies in place at national or local level. There is a Roundtable of National Minorities at the office of the President of Estonia, however, it has not been functional in recent years. There is no website for the roundtable neither any recent news. The roundtable was established in 1993. In 2010 the statues of the roundtable were renewed and the new structure and the new membership was created.<sup>101</sup> The first meeting of the renewed roundtable took place in 26 May 2010, however, after that there are no reports of the activities of the roundtable. According to the information provided by the Foundation Estonian Cooperation Assembly there have been no regular meetings of the roundtable in recent two years. The members of the roundtable are invited to provide input into the activities of the Foundation on ad hoc basis if this is deemed necessary.<sup>102</sup>

However, the practice of migrant consultation on law and policy has taken place in ad hoc basis. During the process of preparation of the Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) six consultative dialogue meetings were organised all over Estonia with TCN.<sup>103</sup> In total 150 TCN participated at those consultative meetings that were held in Russian (Tallinn, Narva, Kohtla-Järve) and in English (Tartu). The project was financed by the European Fond for Integration of Third Country Nationals.

In 2013-2014 Ministry of the Interior (*Siseministeerium*) commissioned a study focusing on the adaptation needs of highly

<sup>101</sup> Estonia, Statues of the National minorities roundtable of the Foundation Estonian Cooperation Assembly (*Eesti Koostöö Kogu Rahvuste ümaralaua statuut*), adopted 14 April 2010. Available at: [http://www.kogu.ee/public/EKK\\_Rahvuste\\_umarlaua\\_statuut.pdf](http://www.kogu.ee/public/EKK_Rahvuste_umarlaua_statuut.pdf)

<sup>102</sup> Estonia, Foundation Estonian Cooperation Assembly (*Eesti Koostöö Kogu*), phone conversation with Keiti Kljavin, head of the office, 4 May 2015.

<sup>103</sup> Estonia, Uus, M. & Kaldur, K. (2013). Open Forums on Integration: Report on Recommendations by Third-Country Nationals regarding Estonia's Integration Policy (*Euroopa kolmandate riikide kodanike lõimumisarutelude aruanne*), Praxis Centre for Policy Studies, Institute of Baltic Studies. Available at: <http://www.ibs.ee/et/publikatsioonid/item/120-euroopa-kolmandate-riikide-kodanike-loimumisarutelude-aruanne>

		<p>skilled migrants. During this study process several migrant groups were consulted via focus groups and discussion seminars. The recommendations for the development of services for highly skilled migrants and their family members were incorporated into the final study report.<sup>104</sup></p> <p>In 2014 Ministry of the Interior initiated the process of the development of National Strategy of Internal Security (<i>Siseturvalisuse arengukava 2015-2020</i>) which also includes sections concerning the adaptation of the beneficiaries of international protection. Organisations working with the refugees such as IOM Tallinn (<i>Rahvusvaheline Migratsiooniorganisatsioon</i>), Estonian Refugee Council (<i>MTÜ Eesti Pagulasabi</i>) and Estonian Human Rights Centre (<i>SA Eesti Inimõiguste Keskus</i>) were invited to take part in the consultation process.<sup>105</sup></p>
	<p>What is the mandate of the body – duration and procedures? In particular specify if and by which modalities these bodies are competent to participate in consultations only on migration or integration issues or if they participate also in consultations on other issues? How do these bodies work in practice?</p>	<p>There are no migrant’s consultative bodies in place on national or on local levels.</p>
	<p>Frequency of convening of the body/-ies/ meetings with competent public authorities. What is foreseen and how is it implemented in practice?</p>	<p>There are no migrant’s consultative bodies in place at national or local level.</p>
	<p>Role in relation to other public or private bodies. Is there a statutory role of coordination and cooperation with other public or private stakeholders foreseen? How is this implemented in practice?</p>	<p>There are no migrant’s consultative bodies in place at national or local level.</p>
	<p>Participation in decision-making (consultative, observer status, voting right etc.). Are such bodies competent to participate in</p>	<p>There are no migrant’s consultative bodies in place at national or local level.</p>

<sup>104</sup> Estonia, Adaptation of Newly Arrived Immigrants in Estonia: choices and policy recommendations in developing comprehensive sustainable system (*Uussisserändajate kohanemine Eestis: valikud ja poliitikaettepanekud tervikliku ja jätkusuutliku süsteemi kujundamiseks*) (2014). Institute of Baltic Studies. Available at: <http://www.ibs.ee/et/publikatsioonid/item/125-uussisser%C3%A4ndajate-kohanemine-eestis-valikud-ja-poliitikaettepanekud-tervikliku-ja-j%C3%A4tkusuutliku-s%C3%BCsteemi-kujundamiseks>

<sup>105</sup> Estonia, Proposal for the development of National Strategy of Internal Security (*Siseturvalisuse arengukava 2015-2020 koostamise ettepanek*), Ministry of the Interior, p. 22. Available at: [https://www.osale.ee/konsultatsioonid/files/consult/262\\_Siseturvalisuse%20arengukava%202015-2020%20koosta....pdf](https://www.osale.ee/konsultatsioonid/files/consult/262_Siseturvalisuse%20arengukava%202015-2020%20koosta....pdf)

	<p>decision-making at national/regional/local level in regard to the design, implementation, assessment and/or review of integration-specific, migration or other policies of general interest? Are such bodies and/or their representatives participating in any way to allocation, distribution, monitoring, evaluation or management of funding social inclusion and integration policies, measures and programmes at national level?</p>	
	<p>What are the modalities for representation and participation of migrants, e.g. elections, designation etc.? What is foreseen and how is it implemented in practice?</p>	<p>There are no migrant's consultative bodies in place at national or local level.</p>
	<p>On which criterion are migrant groups represented (migrant status, foreign-born, foreign nationality etc.)? What is foreseen and how is it implemented in practice?</p>	<p>There are no migrant's consultative bodies in place at national or local level.</p>
	<p>Is there any evidence through formal evaluations or academic research on awareness about such national level consultative bodies among migrants and their descendants, and among the general public?</p>	<p>There are no migrant's consultative bodies in place at national or local level.</p>

### 3.4. Participation in trade-unions and professional association

	<p>In this section based on available data, research, surveys, studies, etc. please provide information about:</p>	
	<p>Membership and participation of migrant workers in <u>workers' unions and craft associations</u>:</p>	
	<p>Are there any legal or practical limitations or barriers for the membership of migrant workers in trade unions and craft associations?</p>	<p>There are no legal barriers for TCNs to belong to trade unions. <sup>106</sup> However, migrant workers might face some practical barriers such as language and consequently access to information. Estonian (or Russian) language knowledge might be essential for equal participation, as was indicated by some foreign nationals at a seminar organised by the Ministry of the Interior.<sup>107</sup></p>

<sup>106</sup> Estonia, Trade Unions Act (Ametühingute seadus), RT I 2000, 57, 372. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/191347>

<sup>107</sup> Estonia, The Agenda of the Integration of Foreigners and the Talent Policy, Seminar in Kamahouse, Tallinn, 20 February 2015. Available at: <http://kamamaja.net/>



	<p>Do workers' associations encourage and support membership and participation of migrant workers? E.g. through information and raising awareness initiatives in more languages, translation and language support services etc.</p>	<p>Trade union participation rates are generally low in Estonia for both migrants and nationals<sup>108</sup> According to the Integration Monitoring 2011 (<i>Integratsiooni monitooring 2011</i>) only 9% of Estonians and 7% of other nations living in Estonia belonged to a trade union or professional associations.<sup>109</sup> The association does not promote actively the participation of foreigners, however, in areas where migrants constitute the majority of workforce, the information dissemination is carried out also in Russian. There are few recent migrants who have arrived to Estonia for work purposes. The majority of migrant population are long-term Russian-speaking residents. There are economic activity areas where Russian-speakers are concentrated such as mining, energy and transport. In the trade unions of these economic areas Russian-speakers are majority of the members of the trade unions.</p> <p>Estonian Trade Union Confederation (<i>Eesti Ametiühingute Liit</i>) provides online information about its activities in Estonian, Russian and with some limitations also in English.<sup>110</sup></p>
	<p>What is the rate of participation (figures and % of association members, figures and % of migrant professionals as members, or descriptive data if statistical data is not available) of migrant workers in the most representative workers' unions and associations? Please specify the geographic and workforce range/type of associations (referring to national, regional, local and to the range of workers represented and degree of association).</p>	<p>The majority of migrant population are long-term Russian-speaking residents. According to the Integration monitoring survey 2011 7% of Russian-speaking respondents declared that they participate in trade union or professional association compared to 9% of Estonian respondents.<sup>111</sup> There are economic activity areas where Russian-speakers are concentrated such as mining, transport and energy. In workers unions in these economic areas (Transport Trade Union, Independent Trade Union of Miners and Energy Sector, Railways Trade Union etc) majority of members are Russian-speaking workers. Other workers' unions and associations reported that no data on migrant background of their members is collected.<sup>112 113</sup></p>
	<p>Are migrant workers elected as representatives of trade</p>	<p>Some of the trade union representatives can be considered as having a migrant background, as they belong to the Russian-speaking population of Estonia.</p>

<sup>108</sup> Estonia, Report on the Collective Labour Relations of the State and Local Government Offices (*Riigi- ja kohalike omavalitsuste asutuste kollektiivsete töösuhete uuring*) Praxis (2011). Available at: <http://www.praxis.ee/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/2011-Riigi-ja-kov-asutuste-kollektiivsed-toosuhted.pdf>

<sup>109</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>110</sup> Estonia, Estonian Trade Union Confederation (*Eesti Ametiühingute Liit*) webpage. Available at: <http://www.eakl.ee/index.php?pid=418&lang=7>

<sup>111</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>112</sup> Estonia, Estonian Doctors Association (*Eesti Arstide Liit*). E-mail correspondence with Ingrid Lesdorf, a member of the association, 2 March 2015.

<sup>113</sup> Estonia, Teachers Union (*Õpetajate Liit*), E-mail correspondence Merike Vent, a coordinator, 4 March 2015.



	<p>unions and workers' or craft associations? Please provide figures if available, and report the related legal or practical limitations or barriers, eventually faced by migrant workers.</p>	<p>However, there are no figures or any studies available about the ethnic/migrant background of the representatives of trade unions. TCNs, including people with "undetermined citizenship", are allowed to be elected as trade union representatives on the same terms as nationals.<sup>114</sup></p>
	<p>Are there differences between associations for high and low skill workers, different industries and trades, and/or different geographic area of country of origin, citizenship or birth or gender?</p>	<p>There are economic activity areas where Russian-speakers are concentrated such as mining, chemical engineering and transport. In workers unions in these economic areas (Transport Trade Union, Independent Trade Union of Miners and Energy Sector, Railways Trade Union etc) majority of members are Russian-speaking workers. Furthermore, these economic activity areas are concentrated in Northern regions of Estonia, to Tallinn and Ida-Viru county. In the trade unions in those geographic areas Russian-speakers with migrant's background constitute a majority of workers as well as members of the trade unions. However, no figures or any studies are available with regard to that issue.</p>
<p>Membership and participation of migrant entrepreneurs and expert professionals to professional and scientific associations:</p>		
	<p>Are there any legal or practical limitations or barriers for the membership of migrant workers in professional, employer and scientific associations (such as medical, engineer, bar associations)?</p>	<p>There are no legal barriers. According to the Bar Association Act (<i>Advokatuuriseadus</i>)<sup>115</sup> the requirements for member advocates are residence in Estonia or citizenship of the Republic of Estonia or of a member state of the European Union. The act also declares that the member of the Bar Association has to have oral and written proficiency in Estonian.<sup>116</sup> Therefore language barrier exists here as in other associations. Good command of Estonian language is among the important prerequisites for working as a doctor or a lawyer in Estonia.</p>
	<p>Do professional associations encourage and support membership and participation of migrant professionals? E.g. through information and raising awareness initiatives in more languages, translation and language support services etc.</p>	<p>Professional associations do not explicitly encourage migrants' participation in their work as there is still rather low number of migrant workers in Estonia.</p>
	<p>What is the rate of participation and membership (figures</p>	<p>Estonian Doctors Association (<i>Eesti Arstide Liit</i>) and Estonian Teachers Union (<i>Eesti Õpetajate Liit</i>) reported</p>

<sup>114</sup> Estonia, Trade Unions Act (*Ametiühingute seadus*). RT I 2000, 57, 372. Available at:

<https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/519012015011/consolide>

<sup>115</sup> Estonia, Bar Association Act (*Advokatuuriseadus*) § 23 (1), RT I 2001, 36, 201. Available at:

<https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/510072014006/consolide>

<sup>116</sup> Estonia, Bar Association Act (*Advokatuuriseadus*) § 23 (1), RT I 2001, 36, 201. Available at:

<https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/510072014006/consolide>

	<p>and % of association members, figures and % of migrant professionals as members, or descriptive data if statistical data is not available) of migrant professionals in the most representative professional, employers' and scientific unions and associations? Please specify the geographic and workforce range/type of associations (referring to national, regional, local and to the range of professional represented and degree of association)</p>	<p>that such data is not collected.<sup>117</sup> <sup>118</sup> Estonian Nurses Association (<i>Õdede Liit</i>) reported they do not have any members with migrant background.<sup>119</sup> According to the Estonian Service and Trade Workers' Union (<i>Eesti Teenindus- ja Kaubandustöötajate Ametiühing (ETKA)</i>), no immigrant work force has been included in their trade union activities. However, according to their representative, labour deficiency in the service sector has led to a situation where the amount of workers whose mother tongue is not Estonian has been continuously increasing.<sup>120</sup> The Estonian Seafarers Independent Trade Union (<i>Eesti Meremeeste Sõltumatu Ametiühing (EMSA)</i>) reported having included no migrant workforce in their activities. However, he reported that about 20% of their members and participants have an ethnic background other than Estonian.<sup>121</sup> Estonian Energy Workers ' Unions' Federation (<i>Eesti Energeetikatöötajate Ametiühingute Liidu (EEAÜL)</i>) confirmed that they have no member workers who could be considered migrants. They have no statistics about the national or ethnic background of their members, but some of them are definitely ethnic Russians. All members are either Estonian citizens or the holders of permanent living permits.<sup>122</sup></p>
	<p>Are migrants elected as representatives of professional, employers' and/or scientific associations? Please provide figures if available, and report the related legal or practical limitations or barriers, eventually faced.</p>	<p>According to the Non-profit Associations Act (<i>Mittetulundusühingute seadus</i>) half of the members of the management board that manages and represents the non-profit organisation must be residents in Estonia, in another Member State of the European Economic Area or in Switzerland.<sup>123</sup> There is no statistics on any other data collected about the ethnic/migrant background of the leaders of professional, employers' and/or scientific associations.</p>
	<p>Are there differences between associations for different professions, different skill levels and/or types of enterprise, different industries and trades, and/or different geographic area of country of origin, citizenship or birth or gender?</p>	<p>The professional associations based on different professions, skill levels and types of enterprises/industries are not differentiated between migrant or non-migrant workers. There is an association of Russian citizens of Narva (<i>Narva Vene Kodanike Liit</i>), however, this is not a professional association. There is very little information available about the activities of this association. It has not been prominent in public debates that concern Russian-speaking community in Estonia.</p>

<sup>117</sup> Estonia, Estonian Doctors Association (*Eesti Arstide Liit*). E-mail correspondence with Ms Ingrid Lesdorf, a prominent member of the association, 2 March 2015.

<sup>118</sup> Estonia, Teachers Union (*Õpetajate Liit*), E-mail correspondence with coordinator Ms Merike Vent, 4 March 2015.

<sup>119</sup> Estonia, Nurses Union (*Õdede Liit*), E-mail correspondence with coordinator Ms Iivi Luik, 27 March 2015.

<sup>120</sup> Estonia, Estonian Service and Trade Workers' Union (*Eesti Teenindus- ja Kaubandustöötajate Ametiühing (ETKA)*), E-mail correspondence with representative Elle Pütsepp, 30 March 2015.

<sup>121</sup> Estonia, Estonian Seafarers Independent Trade Union (*Eesti Meremeeste Sõltumatu Ametiühing (EMSA)*), E-mail correspondence with foreman Mr Jüri Lember, 30 March 2015.

<sup>122</sup> Estonian Energy Workers ' Unions' Federation (*Eesti Energeetikatöötajate Ametiühingute Liidu (EEAÜL)*), E-mail correspondence with foreman Mr Jüri Lember, 30 March 2015.

<sup>123</sup> Estonia, Non-profit Associations Act (*Mittetulundusühingute seadus*), § 26 (3). RT I 1996, 42, 811. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/529012015009/consolide>

### 3.5. Participation in social, cultural and public life

<p>In this section based on available data, research, studies, etc. provide information about the membership and participation of migrants and their descendants in media, cultural organisations and public life:</p>	
<p>Are there any legal or practical limitations or barriers for the membership of migrants in professional associations related to the media, sports and culture?</p>	<p>There are no legal barriers apart from the membership in national sports teams (only citizens can represent a nation). There is no specific data about migrant participation in media, sports and culture associations and barriers migrants might face. However, some information can be discerned from the general civic activism surveys. According to the Integration monitoring survey 2011 (<i>Integratsiooni monitoring 2011</i>) 15% of Estonians and 10% of non-Estonians belong to a sports club; 15% of Estonians and only 6% of non-Estonians belonged to some cultural association.<sup>124</sup> The main practical barriers concern the language – major media, sports and cultural associations (except cultural minority associations) operate in Estonian language. 2011 integration monitoring survey report argues that the language barrier is seen as a main barrier by Estonian associations for low participation of Russian-speaking population in the civil society associations.<sup>125</sup> According to the study conducted by the Tallinn University in 2014, 12% of civil society associations use Estonian and Russian on the daily basis, 6% use mainly Russian and sometimes Estonian and 1% use only Russian (survey sample was 1000 associations).<sup>126</sup> At the same time only 13% of Russian-speaking respondents declared that they speak Estonian freely and further 23% said they understand, speak and write a little bit in Estonian.<sup>127</sup> These survey results indicate to the barrier for Russian-speakers to participate in the work of civil society associations.</p>
<p>Do media, sports, culture professional associations encourage and support membership and participation of third country nationals as members? E.g. through information and raising awareness initiatives in more languages,</p>	<p>These associations do not explicitly encourage the participation of TCNs as members. They do often offer information in Russian and/or English though. According to the Integration monitoring 2011 study (<i>Eesti ühiskonna integratsiooni monitoring 2011</i>) Russian-speaking civil society associations (31% of respondents that actively participate in some CSO) saw the lack of information in Russian language as the main barrier to cooperation between the civil society</p>

<sup>124</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitoring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitoring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitoring_2011.pdf)

<sup>125</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitoring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitoring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitoring_2011.pdf)

<sup>126</sup> Estonia, Institutionalisation of Civic Activism in Estonia 2014. Study report (*Kodanikualgatuse institutionaliseerimine Eestis 2014. Uuringu raport*), Tallinn University & National Foundation of Civil Society. Available at: <http://www.kysk.ee/failid/Upload/files/KUAK%2014%20raport.pdf>

<sup>127</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitoring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitoring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitoring_2011.pdf)

translation and language support services etc.	organisations and between the CSO and the state. <sup>128</sup> There are no surveys that specifically would look at media, sports and culture professional associations.
What is the rate of participation in the most representative professional associations? (figures and % of association members, figures and % of migrant professionals as members, or descriptive data if statistical data is not available)	There is no data collected based on ethnic/migrant background of the members of media, sports and culture associations. For example, from the list of members of Estonian Journalists Association ( <i>Eesti Ajakirjanike Liit</i> ) 24 members out of 211 carry a non-Estonian name. However, this descriptive data is not reliable as the name is not automatically an indicator of migrant background.
Are migrants elected as representatives of professional associations related to the media, sports and culture? Please provide figures if available, and report the related legal or practical limitations or barriers, eventually faced.	There are no legal barriers. According to the Non-profit Organisations and their Associations Act ( <i>Mittetulundusühingute ja nende liitude seadus</i> ) <sup>129</sup> both members and leaders of these associations should be Estonian citizens or the holders of permanent residency.
Is there a visible or notable presence (or absence) of migrants and their descendants as media professionals?	Many of Estonia's notable media professionals – journalists & commentators - could be identified as Russian-speaking Estonians. There exists state-owned Russian-language media (radio, TV) that supports the development of Russian media professionals. Media professionals with more recent immigrant background are however rare.
Are migrants and/or their descendants present, visible and actively participating in public? (E.g. in public events, TV and electronic media, cultural events). Please substantiate on the basis of existing data or contacts with relevant authorities, actors and stakeholders, making sure to cover a wide spectrum and obtain as much as possible objective information.	There is no existing data, surveys or research carried out on that issue in Estonia. There are many famous top sportsmen, show business people, writers, publicists, journalists as opinion leaders and civil society activists who are from Russian (migrant) descent and who are regularly visible in public.
Are there legal or practical limitations for the media, culture or	There are few legal limitations regarding the media. According to the Estonian language act ( <i>Keeleseadus</i> ), foreign language media should be accompanied by an

<sup>128</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>129</sup> Estonia, Non-profit Organisations and their Associations Act (*Mittetulundusühingute ja nende liitude seadus*), § 7 (3). RT I 1996, 42, 811. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/28659>

	<p>other type of public events by migrants and/or their descendants? (E.g. are there national language requirements for TV or radio stations, bureaucratic and representation requirements, etc.)</p>	<p>appropriate Estonian language translation. A translation into Estonian is not required for language learning programmes or programmes that are immediately retransmitted or in the case of the newsreader's text of originally produced foreign language news programmes and of originally produced live foreign language programmes. The volume of foreign language news programmes and live foreign language programmes without the specified translations into Estonian shall not exceed ten per cent of the volume of weekly original production. A translation into Estonian is not required in the case of radio programmes that are aimed at a foreign language audience. The foreign language texts of speech included in the radio programmes in Estonian shall be translated into Estonian.<sup>130</sup></p> <p>Regarding the culture or public events there are legal limitations in relation to the language. According to the Language Act (<i>Keeleseadus</i>) at public events the organiser shall ensure the translation into Estonian of the essential information in a foreign language.<sup>131</sup> Language Inspectorate (<i>Keeleinspeksioon</i>) controls the implementation of the Language Act and according to them they randomly visit public events or initiate a procedure when the complaint is filed regarding the violation of the Language Act.<sup>132</sup></p> <p>Practical limitations may include lack of information about public events as the information is mostly in Estonian.</p>
	<p>Are there positive measures for promoting or restrictions/barriers to the operation of migrant and ethnic minority (owned, directed or audience specific) media?</p>	<p>Currently there are the following Russian-speaking media channels: national radio channel Radio 4, private radio channels, private newspaper Postimees and private news portal Delfi, several private Russian-language TV programmes that air nation-wide or locally. Additionally Estonian National Broadcasting (<i>Eesti Rahvusringhääling</i>) news portal is translated into Russian and English. There are several regional and local news portals and newspapers in Russian language only, mostly in Ida-Viru county. As of 1 September 2015 a national Russian-language TV channel will start operating. Until now Russian-language subtitled programmes are run on ETV2 (national channel 2) and Russian-language news are aired on the same channel on daily basis.</p> <p>In recent years in the light of information war with Russia Estonian government has taken efforts to promote Russian-speaking audience specific national media. According to the Estonian Public Broadcasting Act (<i>Eesti rahvusringhäälingu seadus</i>) one of the tasks</p>

<sup>130</sup> Estonia, Language act (*Keeleseadus*) § 18 (1,2,3). RT I, 18.03.2011, 1. Available at:

<https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/514012015007/consolide>

<sup>131</sup> Estonia, Language act (*Keeleseadus*) § 15 (5). RT I, 18.03.2011, 1. Available at:

<https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/514012015007/consolide>

<sup>132</sup> Estonia, Language Inspectorate (*Keeleinspeksioon*), telephone conversation with Mr. Leho Klaser, Chief Inspector at Language Inspectorate, 24 March 2015.

		of the public broadcasting is to transmit programmes that address the information needs of all population groups in Estonia, including minorities. <sup>133</sup> In 2014 the decision was made to launch a Russian-language national TV channel ETV+ that will start airing programmes from September 2015. Already before that the decision was made to increase the financial and human resources available to the Estonian national news programme "Aktuaalne Kaamera" in Russian language to provide more extensive new covering programme.
	Are there practical measures encouraging and promoting the visibility, voice and public presence of migrants and/or their descendants in the media, culture or other type of public events? (E.g. are there programmes and information provided by the media in other than the country official language, and migrants' languages, quotas for journalists and public programmes reflecting the diversity in society etc.?)	For minority/migrant media see question above. There are no quotas for journalists or public programmes reflecting the diversity. However, the national TV has the practice of involving minority and migrant communities in their programmes. Integration and Migration Foundation Our People ( <i>Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed</i> ) has financed over the years several TV programmes that reflect the cultural and ethnic diversity in Estonian society.

### 3.5.1. Diversity in the public sector

	In this section based on available data, research, studies, etc. please provide information about recruitment of migrants and their descendants in the public sector:	
	Please describe how legal provisions allow or prevent the recruitment of third country nationals in the public sector. Please indicate specific areas, requirements, quotas if any, upward mobility and promotion limitations if any, as well as if and how these provisions are applied in practice.	According to the Estonian Civil Service Act ( <i>Avaliku teenistuse seadus</i> ), public servants are the staff employed by central government institutions (ministries, administrative agencies, boards and inspectorates, constitutional institutions, county governments) and local governments (226 towns and rural municipalities). The requirements for employment include among other things the requirement for being an Estonian citizen or a citizen of a Member State of the European Union and being proficient in Estonian. Only Estonian citizens shall be appointed to a post related to the directing of the authorities, the exercise of state supervision, the national defence and judicial power, the processing of state secrets or classified information of foreign states, the representing of public prosecution or diplomatic representation of the state, and the posts in which an official has the right, in order

<sup>133</sup> Estonia, Estonian Public Broadcasting Act (*Eesti rahvusringhäälingu seadus*) § 5 (8). RT I 2007, 10, 46. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/12786086>



		<p>to guarantee public order and security, to restrict the fundamental rights and freedom of a person.<sup>134</sup></p> <p>According to the Language Act (<i>Keeleseadus</i>) officials and employees of state agencies and of local government authorities, as well as employees of legal persons in public law and agencies thereof, members of legal persons in public law, notaries, bailiffs, sworn translators and the employees of their bureaus shall be able to understand and use Estonian at the level which is necessary to perform their service or employment duties. The requirements for proficiency in and use of the Estonian language for officials, employees and sole proprietors is established by a Regulation of the Government of the Republic.<sup>135</sup> The regulation of the Government of Estonia (<i>Avaliku teenistuja, töötaja ning füüsilisest isikust ettevõtja eesti keele oskuse ja kasutamise nõuded</i>) regulates clearly what levels of language knowledge is required from what kind of public service employee.<sup>136</sup> The responsibility to ensure the language proficiency required by the law lies with the employer.<sup>137</sup> Persons who have acquired basic, secondary or higher education in Estonian need not pass the Estonian language proficiency examination.<sup>138</sup> Language Inspectorate (<i>Keeleinspeksioon</i>) controls the implementation of the Language Act and according to them they randomly control the language proficiency (by certificate) of civil servants and employees and local government officials, or initiate a procedure when the complaint is filed regarding the violation of the Language Act.<sup>139</sup></p> <p>There are no quotas for ethnic/migrant background population in civil service. The upward mobility is often hindered by the lack of proficiency in Estonian (the highest C1 level) or the lack of citizenship.</p>
	<p>Please indicate if citizens of migrant descent can also be affected by limitation – e.g. on the basis of their ethnic origin or migrant</p>	<p>The legal limitations are described above and they concern the education, law enforcement and judiciary. There are no legal or recorded practical limitations based on the ethnic origin or migrant background or naturalisation. However, the rather high language requirements set practical barriers for Russian-</p>

<sup>134</sup> Estonia, Civil Service Act (*Avaliku teenistuse seadus*) § 14 (1,2). RT I, 06.07.2012, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/509072014003/consolide>

<sup>135</sup> Estonia, Language act (*Keeleseadus*) § 23 (1,4). RT I, 18.03.2011, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/514012015007/consolide>

<sup>136</sup> Estonia, Requirements for Estonian Language Proficiency and Usage for Civil Servants, Employees and Physical Person Entrepreneur (*Avaliku teenistuja, töötaja ning füüsilisest isikust ettevõtja eesti keele oskuse ja kasutamise nõuded*), Regulation of the Government of Estonia, adopted 20.06.2011, RT I, 29.12.2011, 169. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/129122011169>

<sup>137</sup> Estonia, Requirements for Estonian Language Proficiency and Usage for Civil Servants, Employees and Physical Person Entrepreneur (*Avaliku teenistuja, töötaja ning füüsilisest isikust ettevõtja eesti keele oskuse ja kasutamise nõuded*), Regulation of the Government of Estonia, adopted 20.06.2011, RT I, 29.12.2011, 169. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/129122011169>

<sup>138</sup> Estonia, Language act (*Keeleseadus*) § 23 (1,4). RT I, 18.03.2011, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/514012015007/consolide>

<sup>139</sup> Estonia, Language Inspectorate (*Keeleinspeksioon*), telephone conversation with Mr. Leho Klaser, Chief Inspector of Language Inspectorate, 24 March 2015.

background or naturalisation - in public sector recruitment, for example in education, law enforcement, judiciary, etc.	speakers to be recruited or to advance in the career in the public sector. There have been no instances of non-recognition of educational qualifications as there are very few persons with recent migrant background applying for public service.
Please indicate proportion of recruitment (% on the total of posts for this category or service) for the interested categories of third country nationals, if any.	No such data has been collected.
Please indicate any affirmative action and positive action <b>either</b> for third country nationals <b>or</b> citizens with a migrant background, if any, e.g. quotas, reserved posts for people of migrant background etc. as well as promising practices in this area. Please provide information specifically for law enforcement, judiciary, and education.	There are no such measures implemented in Estonia. Since Estonia has parallel Estonian and Russian-language school system, majority of the teachers working in the Russian-language schools are of migrant background. Estonian Police and Boarder Guard Board ( <i>Politsei ja Piirivalveamet</i> ) does not collect data about the ethnic/migrant background of their employees. <sup>140</sup>

### 3.6. Political activity – active citizenship

Membership and participation of migrants in migrant and/or diaspora organisations and associations:	
Are there any legal or practical limitations or barriers for the self-organisation membership of migrants in migrant and or diaspora associations and organisations?	There are no legal barriers as according to the Not-for-Profit Organisations Act ( <i>Mittetulundusühingute seadus</i> ) the NGO or association can be established by legal or physical persons. There are no requirements based on citizenship. <sup>141</sup> However, there are some limitations set by the Language Act ( <i>Keeleseadus</i> ) which says that the employees of non-profit associations and foundations, as well as the members of the board of the non-profit associations with the compulsory membership must be proficient in Estonian to the level that is necessary to perform their employment duties. This shall be applied if it is justified in the public interest. <sup>142</sup>
Are there notable cases of active migrant and/or	The most active migrant association in recent years is Russian School in Estonia ( <i>MTÜ Vene Kool Eestis</i> ,

<sup>140</sup> Estonia, Police and Boarder Guard Board (*Politsei- ja Piirivalveamet*), e-mail correspondence with Mr. Martin Luige, press secretary, 24 March 2015.

<sup>141</sup> Estonia, Not-for-Profit Organisations Act (*Mittetulundusühingute seadus*) § 5. RT I 1996, 42, 811. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/13278757>

<sup>142</sup> Estonia, Language act (*Keeleseadus*) § 23 (2). RT I, 18.03.2011, 1. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/514012015007/consolide>

	<p>diaspora associations and organisations? Please indicate the most known, active or representative ones on the basis of existing data about membership – please include size/numbers of members - and through contacts with competent actors and stakeholders. Please specify their character and eventual differences, including aspects concerning their religious, culture or geographic scope.</p>	<p><i>Русская Школа Эстонии</i>).<sup>143</sup> The association started its existence in 2004 when the conflict between the authorities of the Tartu city and the local Russian community evolved over the local Russian school. The association considers its main aim to support the existence of Russian-language education in Estonia in pre-school, basic school and higher educational levels. The association has 184 individual members and it operates all over Estonia.<sup>144</sup></p> <p>In Ida-Virumaa an NGO Ida-Virumaa Integration Centre (<i>Ida-Virumaa Integratsioonikeskus</i>) operates that manages the roundtable of national minority associations of Ida-Virumaa county. It mainly focuses on minority cultural and educational issues such as promotion of folk culture and native language learning.<sup>145</sup></p> <p>There are several youth NGOs that focus on the promotion of integration among Estonian and Russian-speaking youth. The most prominent are MTÜ Kontakt<sup>146</sup> and MTÜ KoosVmeste.<sup>147</sup> These NGOs focus on youth cooperation, building community connections and promoting tolerance.</p> <p>There is a large number of cultural associations of minorities. In most cases they are small local associations of diaspora groups (Ukrainians, Belorussians etc). There is an umbrella association (roundtable) of national minority associations of Ida-Virumaa (<i>Ida-Virumaa rahvuskultuuriseltside ümarlaud</i>) that has the membership of 34 associations.<sup>148</sup></p> <p>There are no associations that represent the interest of people with “undetermined citizenship”.</p>
	<p>Please provide any data on the participation of migrants and their descendants in the most representative migrant and/or diaspora organisations and associations? (figures and % of migrants and/or persons with the specific ethnic or other background as members, or descriptive data if statistical data is not available).</p>	<p>There is no such data available or collected.</p>

<sup>143</sup> Estonia, Russian School in Estonia (Русская Школа Эстонии), <http://www.venekool.eu/>

<sup>144</sup> Estonia, Russian School in Estonia (Русская Школа Эстонии), e-mail correspondence with Mr. Mstislav Rusakov, chairman, 24 March 2015.

<sup>145</sup> Estonia, Ida-Virumaa Integratsioonikeskus (*Ida-Virumaa Integratsioonikeskus*) website: <http://www.integratsioonikeskus.ee/index.htm>

<sup>146</sup> Estonia, NGO Contact (*MTÜ Kontakt*) website: <http://www.mtukontakt.ee/>

<sup>147</sup> Estonia, NGO Together (*MTÜ KoosVmeste*) website: <http://www.koosvmeste.com/>

<sup>148</sup> Estonia, Ida-Virumaa Integratsioonikeskus (*Ida-Virumaa Integratsioonikeskus*) website: <http://www.integratsioonikeskus.ee/index.files/Page440.htm>

	<p>Are such associations and organisations encouraged and/or supported financially or in other means (e.g. offices) by the national, regional or local authorities? Is there in place a mechanism linking such associations at national level? (e.g. network of migrant associations).</p>	<p>Cultural minority diaspora organisations are eligible to receive funding from the Ministry of Culture programme of financial support for national minorities culture accociations (<i>Rahvusvähemuste kultuuriühingute toetusprogramm</i>). Tallinn city has its own financing programme <i>Kodurahu programm</i> for integration among youth and for cultural events of national minorities.</p> <p>There is a web portal <i>Etnoweb</i><sup>149</sup> that aims to link together cultural and other ethnic/migrant associations. Network of Estonian Nonprofit Organizations (<i>Eesti Mittetulundusühingute ja Sihtasutuste Liit</i>, EMSL) coordinates a separate information network of NGOs in Russian language. EMSL also opened recently a development programme for Russian-language NGOs in Estonia.<sup>150</sup></p> <p>The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>) foresees as one of its measures to support the development of daily contacts, communication and participation of people with different ethnic/linguistic/cultural background. Under this measure cooperation and integration projects of national minorities and migrant associations will be financed.<sup>151</sup></p>
<p>Membership and participation of migrants in civil society organisations and voluntary work:</p>		
	<p>Are there any legal or practical limitations or barriers for the membership of migrants in civil society organisations?</p>	<p>There are no legal barriers. However, the language issue is of the main concern and constitutes a practical barrier. According to the Integration monitoring 2011 study (<i>Integratsiooni monitoring 2011</i>) civil society representatives claimed that the lack of proficiency of migrants in Estonian and the lack of proficiency of Estonians in Russian (and other migrant languages) constitutes a main reason for lower participation rates of Russian-speakers in CSO activities. Also lack of information in Russian language was cited as an obstacle. Russian-speaking civil society associations (31% of respondents that actively participate in some CSO) saw the lack of information in Russian language as the main barrier to cooperation between the civil society organisations and between the CSO and the state.<sup>152</sup></p>
	<p>Do civil society organisations encourage and support membership and participation of migrants and/or their descendants? E.g. through information and</p>	<p>The need to involve more Russian-speakers in CSO activities is acknowledge on the state level. The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>) points to the need to encourage the cooperation between the CSOs of people with different ethnic/migrant background. The strategy foresees the financial support for the organisations that</p>

<sup>149</sup> See more: <http://www.etnoweb.ee/>

<sup>150</sup> See more: <http://www.emsl.ee/>

<sup>151</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf)

<sup>152</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitoring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitoring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitoring_2011.pdf)

	<p>raising awareness initiatives in more languages, translation and language support services etc.</p>	<p>focus on civic cooperation between the people of different linguistic/ethnic/cultural background.<sup>153</sup> Network of Estonian Nonprofit Organizations (<i>Eesti Mittetulundusühingute ja Sihtasutuste Liit</i>, EMSL) coordinates a separate information network of NGOs in Russian language. EMSL also opened recently a development programme for Russian-language NGOs in Estonia.<sup>154</sup></p>
	<p>Please provide any data on the participation and membership of migrants and their descendants in the most representative civil society organisations? (Figures or % of organisation members, % of migrants and/or with migrant background as members, or descriptive data if statistical data is not available).</p>	<p>There is no such data available.</p>
<p>Membership and participation of migrants in political parties:</p>		
	<p>Are there any legal or practical limitations or barriers for the membership of migrants in political parties, initiatives (e.g. petitions, signature collections) and movements?</p>	<p>According to Estonian Political Parties Act (<i>Erakonnaseadus</i>) only an Estonian citizen or a citizen of the European Union who is not an Estonian citizen, but has permanent residence in Estonia, who has active legal capacity and has attained 18 years of age may be a member of a political party.<sup>155</sup></p> <p>Regarding political initiatives and movements there are no legal barriers for migrant participation. Movements are registered as not-for-profit associations (MTÜ) and according to the Non-profit Associations Act (<i>Mittetulundusühingute seadus</i>) half of the members of the management board that manages and represents the non-profit organisation must be residents in Estonia, in another Member State of the European Economic Area or in Switzerland.<sup>156</sup></p> <p>According to the Public Meeting Act (<i>Avaliku koosoleku seadus</i>)<sup>157</sup> the organiser of a public meeting can be an Estonian citizen, as well as a foreigner with a long-term resident permit or a permanent right to residency.</p> <p>Practical barriers for migrants include low proficiency of Estonian language and insufficient information flows in</p>

<sup>153</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “Lõimuv Eesti 2020” (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eeesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eeesti.pdf)

<sup>154</sup> See more: <http://www.emsl.ee/>

<sup>155</sup> Estonia, Estonian Political Parties Act (*Erakonnaseadus*) § 5 (1). RT I 1994, 40, 654. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/523122014002/consolide>

<sup>156</sup> Estonia, Non-profit Associations Act (*Mittetulundusühingute seadus*), § 26 (3), RT I 1996, 42, 811. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/529012015009/consolide>

<sup>157</sup> Estonia, Public Meeting Act (*Avaliku koosoleku seadus*), § 6 (4). RT I 1997, 30, 472. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/505052014001/consolide>

		other languages than Estonian. As an example, the main petitions portal <i>Petitsioon.ee</i> is available only in Estonian language. <sup>158</sup>
	Do political parties encourage and support membership and participation of migrants and/or their descendants in their activities? E.g. through information and raising awareness initiatives in more languages, translation and language support services etc.	Political parties in Estonia have become more aware of the need to recruit Russian-speaking Estonians as members. This is mostly driven by the attempt to gain more votes from the respective community. Almost all major political parties carry their information and election campaigns also in Russian language, although the Central Party ( <i>Keskerakond</i> ) that receives by far the biggest support among Russian voters has its website only in Estonian language. <sup>159</sup> Gaining the support of Russian-speaking voters is seen by some political parties as far too expensive and inefficient. <sup>160</sup>
	Please provide any data on the participation and membership of migrants and their descendants in the political parties, initiatives and movements? (figures or % of party members, % of migrants and/or with migrant background as members, or descriptive data if statistical data is not available)	Such data is not collected by any political party or a movement in Estonia.
	Are migrants elected as representatives of political parties, initiatives and movements? Please provide figures if available, and report the related legal or practical limitations or barriers, eventually faced.	There is no official data, however, many members of the management board or elected representatives to <i>Riigikogu</i> of mainstream political parties are of Russian decent. This concerns all mainstream parties, including right-wing national conservative parties such as Pro Patria and Res Publica Union ( <i>Isamaa ja Res Publica Liit, IRL</i> ).

### 3.7.Civic and citizenship education

	The participation of migrants and their descendants (with a distinct linguistic, cultural background) in education:	
	Have teachers of migrant background equal access to <b>employment</b> in education, as teachers? If yes, what is the rate of participation (% of	There are no legal limitations for migrants to work as teachers at school. Since Estonia has two parallel language systems in education – Estonian and Russian language schools – it can be argued that there are many teachers of migrant background working in schools, mainly Russian-language schools. There is no

<sup>158</sup> Estonian Petition Portal (*Petitsioon.ee*) available at: <http://petitsioon.ee/>

<sup>159</sup> Estonian Central Party (*Eesti Keskerakond*) website available at: [www.keskerakond.ee](http://www.keskerakond.ee)

<sup>160</sup> Estonia, Postimees (2013), ‘Nutt: Attracting Russian voters requires resources, which do not pay off’ (*Nutt: vene valijate puudmine nõuab ressursse, mis ei tasu end ära*), 23 October 2013. Available at: <http://www.postimees.ee/2571788/nutt-vene-valijate-puudmine-nouab-ressursse-mis-ei-tasu-end-ara>



	<p>teachers with migrant background at national level)? Are they represented in professional teacher associations? Please identify limitations, challenges and promising practice.</p>	<p>data about the rate of participation as such data is not collected.</p> <p>The access to employment as a teacher depends greatly on the proficiency in Estonian language. According to the regulation of the Government of Estonia on Requirements for Estonian Language Proficiency and Usage for Civil Servants, Employees and Physical Person Entrepreneur (<i>Avaliku teenistuja, töötaja ning füüsilisest isikust ettevõtja eesti keele oskuse ja kasutamise nõuded</i>) teachers need to have the proficiency in Estonian language at least on the level of B2.<sup>161</sup> Many teachers of the Russian-language schools do not, however, meet the language requirements, partly due to the fact that the requirements had not been enforced yet at the time they started teaching. i.e. Soviet times. Language Inspectorate (<i>Keeleinspeksioon</i>) carries out regular controls of the language proficiency of the teachers of Russian-language schools. In 2014 Language Inspectorate controlled the language proficiency certificates of 1131 teachers in Russian-language pre-schools and schools, out of which 938 teachers did not have the required level of proficiency.<sup>162</sup></p>
	<p>Are there any particular gender issues?</p>	<p>No known gender issues have been reported.</p>
	<p>Are parents of migrant background actively participating in the school life? Please provide evidence concerning their participation in parents associations, school and community events and extracurricular activities, consultations etc.</p>	<p>There is no data about the ethnic/migrant background of parents. No such data is collected. There have been no studies carried out in that area.</p> <p>Russian School in Estonia is an association that is mainly focused on the rights advocacy regarding the Russian-language schools. The association is arguing for the full level of only Russian-language education as compared to the current legislation where fully Russian-language education is provided only until upper-secondary level (<i>gümnaasium</i>). Russian School in Estonia is not carrying out activities focused on the parents of children with migrant background with an aim to involve them in the school life.</p>
	<p>Are there extracurricular activities involving and engaging with children and parents of migrant background and/or focusing on civic and citizenship education? Please identify limitations, challenges and promising practice.</p>	<p>Civic and citizenship education is offered to all children on both basic and secondary levels as part of official curricula. Extracurricular activities are carried out on the project basis through call for proposals of Integration and Migration Foundation Our People (<i>Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed</i>). As an example, currently there is call for proposals to organise events and prepare materials about the active citizenship and tolerance. The aim of the activities should be promoting active citizenship, creating awareness about active citizenship, promoting tolerance for working together in multicultural</p>

<sup>161</sup> Estonia, Requirements for Estonian Language Proficiency and Usage for Civil Servants, Employees and Physical Person Entrepreneur (*Avaliku teenistuja, töötaja ning füüsilisest isikust ettevõtja eesti keele oskuse ja kasutamise nõuded*), Regulation of the Government of Estonia, adopted 20.06.2011, RT I, 29.12.2011, 169. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/129122011169>

<sup>162</sup> Estonia, Language Inspectorate (*Keeleinspeksioon*) (2014). Annual report of Language Inspectorate, 2014 (*Keeleinspeksiooni 2014. aasta tegevuse aruanne*). Available at: <http://www.keeleinsp.ee/?menu=30&news=1093>

		<p>collectives and for bringing together young people from different linguistic and ethnic background to develop joint activities. The target group of the projects is identified as pupils of secondary and vocational schools aged 7-26.<sup>163</sup></p> <p>Annually the Citizen Day is celebrated that focuses mainly on promoting citizenship among youth with migrant background. The Day is organised by Integration and Migration Foundation "Our People" (<i>Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus "Meie Inimesed"</i>) and it has two main activities: a citizen quiz for schoolchildren and an essay competition. The quiz focuses on constitutional rights and institutions, also on freedoms and responsibilities as citizen. Part of the questionnaire also focuses on European Union issues.<sup>164</sup></p>
	<p>Are there provisions for bilingual education? If yes, is it supported by trained teachers and training programmes, curriculum provisions and dedicated school manuals and books?</p>	<p>According to the Basic Schools and Upper Secondary Schools Act (<i>Põhikooli ja gümnaasiumi seadus</i>) in basic and upper secondary schools the language of instruction is Estonian. In a municipal basic school (<i>põhikool</i>) the language of instruction can also be some other language based on the decision of the local municipality. In municipal upper secondary schools (<i>gümnaasium</i>) or in single classes the language of instruction may be any language on the basis of a decision of the municipality relying on a proposal of the board of trustees of the school or on the basis of a decision of the minister responsible for the field. However, for upper secondary schools the permission to pursue studies in another language or bilingual studies is granted by the Government of the Republic on the basis of an application of a municipality. The board of trustees of the school makes such a proposal to the rural municipality or city government on the basis of the development plan of the school.<sup>165</sup></p> <p>One of the popular practices of bilingual education is the so-called <i>Keelekümblus</i> or language immersion programme (organised by Innove) which promotes bilingual subject learning.<sup>166</sup> The Language immersion programme has been implemented in Estonian schools since 1990ies. The programme has a large library of teaching materials as well as trainings for both teachers and school directors. Currently, the languages used with this teaching method are Russian and Estonian.</p>
	<p>Is there evidence of school segregation and/or policies of</p>	<p>There is no evidence of school segregation in terms of disqualifying children from Russian-speaking families entering Estonian-language schools or <i>vice-versa</i>.</p>

<sup>163</sup> For more information see: [http://www.meis.ee/kaimasolevad-konkursid?project\\_id=627](http://www.meis.ee/kaimasolevad-konkursid?project_id=627)

<sup>164</sup> Estonia, Integration and Migration Foundation "Our People" (*Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus "Meie Inimesed"*) website: <http://www.meis.ee/kodanikupaeva-viktoriin>

<sup>165</sup> Estonia, Basic Schools and Upper Secondary Schools Act (*Põhikooli ja gümnaasiumi seadus*) § 21 (2,3). RT I 2010, 41, 240. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/519032015002/consolide>

<sup>166</sup> Estonia, Language Immersion (*Keelekümblus*), Innove. Available at: <http://kke.innove.ee/>

	separate/distinct schooling of migrants?	
	Is there evidence of modifying school curricula and teaching materials can be modified to reflect the diversity of the school population? Is the teacher regular curricula/training dealing with specific reference to immigrants or ethnic minorities and respect/promotion of diversity?	<p>According to the National Curriculum for Basic Schools (<i>Põhikooli riiklik õppekava</i>)<sup>167</sup> and National Curriculum for Upper-Secondary Schools (<i>Keskooli riiklik õppekava</i>)<sup>168</sup> among the competences taught to the student are valuing his or her ethnicity and culture among other ethnicities and cultures, espousing an attitude toward people that is free of prejudices, recognizing the differences between people, and understanding the need for compromise. Additionally in upper classes students must have a conception and knowledge of different cultures of the world and respect people from other ethnicities.</p> <p>Ministry of Culture and Integration and Migration Foundation Our People commissioned an information material prepared by the Tartu University Narva College about adaptation of students with different mother tongue in Estonian schools.<sup>169</sup> The material is intended for teachers and school principals to help with the adaptation of the students whose mother tongue is different than the language of instruction at the school.</p> <p>There are two study books prepared by Eduko programme and financed under European Social Fund for students in teacher education of basic and upper-secondary schools that explain the teaching in multicultural class where pupils come from different cultural, ethnic, linguistic or religious backgrounds.<sup>170</sup></p> <p>According to the most recent study commissioned by the Ministry of Education and Research teachers expressed the need to have more trainings on diversity in classroom.<sup>171</sup> They have also highlighted the need for support with regard to bilingual children and their special needs.<sup>172</sup></p>
	Are all students – not only of migrant background – targeted and/involved by civic	The projects that promote civic education are either targeted to all pupils in the school or there are specific projects targeted at ethnic/migrant minority pupils (Russian-language schools).

<sup>167</sup> Estonia, National Curriculum for Basic Schools (*Põhikooli riiklik õppekava*) § 2 (3); § 9 (3); § 11 (2); § 14 (4), 6 January 2011. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/524092014014/consolide> :

<sup>168</sup> Estonia, National curriculum for Upper-Secondary Schools (*Keskooli riiklik õppekava*), 6 January 2011. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/524092014009/consolide> )

<sup>169</sup> Estonia, Soll, M., Palginõmm, M-L., (2011). Students with Different Mother Tongue in Estonian Schools (*Õppekeelest erineva emakeelega õpilane koolis*). Ministry of Culture, Integration and Migration Foundation Our People.

<sup>170</sup> Estonia, Studying and Teaching in Multicultural Environment (*Õppimine ja õpetamine mitmekultuurilises keskkonnas*), Airi Kukk (Eds), Maia Muldma, Jelena Nõmm (authors). Eduko, SA Archimedes. Available at: <http://avastustee.ee/leht/aju/publ/6pp6petmulti1.pdf>; Estonia, Studying and Teaching in Multicultural Environment: Example of Language Immersion Programme (*Õppimine ja õpetamine mitmekultuurilises keskkonnas: keelekümbelprogrammi näitel*), Airi Kukk (Eds), Maire Kebbinau, Urve Aja (Authors). Eduko, SA Archimedes. Available at: <http://avastustee.ee/leht/aju/publ/6pp6petmulti2.pdf>

<sup>171</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*), Research Report on Teachers' Additional Training Needs (*Uuring Õpetajate täiendusõppe vajadused*) (2015). Available at: [http://dspace.utlib.ee/dspace/bitstream/handle/10062/45196/Opetaja\\_taiendus%20vajadus.pdf?sequence=1](http://dspace.utlib.ee/dspace/bitstream/handle/10062/45196/Opetaja_taiendus%20vajadus.pdf?sequence=1) ).

<sup>172</sup> Estonia, Project Foreign-language Child in Estonian School. Final Report (*Projekt Muukeelne laps Eesti koolis. Lõpparuanne*) (2012). Tallinna Ülikooli Psühholoogia Instituut.

	education and activities related to migrant integration at schools?	
The implementation of specific measures and initiatives aiming at (the following possible practices on the left is an indicative and non-exhaustive list):		
	<p><b>Please use the following as indicative list of possible practices to report on:</b></p> <p>Improving the way civic and citizenship education reflect diversity in society through curricular and extracurricular activities. Are there specific programmes helping young people to learn how to live in a society with people from different cultures and religions?</p>	<p>There is language learning support to students with migrant background in Estonian-language schools. A migrant pupil or national minority pupil can receive an extra learning support for Estonian language based on individual curriculum. Individual curriculum can be drawn up by the school based on the Basic Schools and Upper Secondary Schools Act (<i>Põhikooli ja gümnaasiumi seadus</i>).<sup>173</sup></p> <p>Integration and Migration Foundation Our People (<i>Integratsiooni ja Migratsiooni Sihtasutus Meie Inimesed</i>) organises regularly project calls for proposals on civic and citizenship education activities targeted to schools. Currently there is call for proposals for such projects that focuses on citizenship education as promotion of tolerance in multicultural environment of schools. The target group of the call are basic and upper secondary schools and vocational schools.<sup>174</sup></p>
	Improving the way formal curriculum subjects, e.g. literature, history, etc. promote mutual understanding, respect for ethnic and religious diversity and the common democratic and pluralist values?	
	Facilitating equal opportunities in education for children with migrant background?	
	Facilitating the involvement, participation and support of parents with migrant background in the educational system and in the school activities?	
	Providing language learning support to students of migrant background?	

<sup>173</sup> Estonia, Basic Schools and Upper Secondary Schools Act (*Põhikooli ja gümnaasiumi seadus*). RT I 2010, 41, 240.

Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/ee/Riigikogu/act/519032015002/consolide>

<sup>174</sup> Information available here: [http://www.meis.ee/kaimasolevad-konkursid?project\\_id=627](http://www.meis.ee/kaimasolevad-konkursid?project_id=627)

	Improving attendance and reducing drop-out of students with migrant background?	
	Improving school and teachers' capacity to embrace build on and/or manage diversity?	
	In particular, please specify if there are promising practices, including affirmative action / positive action practices designed to tackle structural inequalities	
	Other...	

### 3.8. Drivers, barriers for the implementation, monitoring and assessment of legislation & policy measures

<p>Previous paragraphs indicated in detail aspects about the actual implementation of participation policies, normative framework and measures. In this section briefly summarize the most important drivers, positive factors and the barriers, resistance or negative factors that have been identified regarding the design, implementation, monitoring and assessment of policy measures and normative framework for the political and social participation of migrants and their descendants. Please base the analysis on governmental and non-governmental</p>	<p>The main issue that hinders the participation of Russian-speaking population in Estonia is the lack of citizenship. Although the naturalisation rates were high during the immediate period after the collapse of the Soviet Union in 1990ies the number of people with undetermined citizenship remains still significant at 84,494 persons. There are additionally 89,913 citizens of Russian Federation.<sup>175</sup> The problem of lack of citizenship for 1/3 of Russian-speakers have been the focus of political debates for a decade. However, the consensus on the extent of changes needed in legislation in order to change the status of undetermined citizens have not been reached.</p> <p>Stemming from the lack of citizenship among large number of Soviet time settlers, the focus of measures designed to increase political participation of Russian-speaking migrant minority have concentrated on supporting naturalisation process (language exam support, awareness campaigns) and less on other aspects that hinder political participation. In 2006 Integration Foundation carried out nation-wide awareness campaign where 118 000 information leaflets were posted to addresses of people with undetermined citizenship. The project was financed from the EU Transition Facility fund.<sup>176</sup></p>
--	--

<sup>175</sup> The numbers are from 2011 Population Census.

<sup>176</sup> Estonia, Integration Foundation (2006). Integration Foundation is starting a nation-wide awareness campaign for people with undetermined citizenship (*Integratsiooni Sihtasutus alustab ulatuslikku teavitust määratlemata kodakondsusega isikutele*), news 26 October 2006. Available at: [http://www.meis.ee/uudised?news\\_id=151](http://www.meis.ee/uudised?news_id=151)

	<p>reports, as well as research and studies.</p>	<p>The general focus of the integration policies has been the provision of Estonian language training (cultural integration), which has been seen as the main key to better integration. This approach has been heavily criticised in relevant sociological literature<sup>177, 178</sup>, but efforts still have to be made to overcome this too narrow view of integration and focus more on the aspects of socio-economic integration, citizenship participation and political participation.<sup>179</sup> Estonian integration monitoring study 2011 authors argue that all political parties need to increase their effort to engage Russian-speaking electorate and pay more attention to the problems and expectations of this electorate.<sup>180</sup></p> <p>In parallel the positive factors can also be identified. A slow but steady increase of politicians in municipal and national level who have Russian background can be observed (in Estonia that often refers to migrant background at the same time). Already in 2005 local elections, 24 out of 63 members elected to the Tallinn City Council in 2005 are non-Estonian, while an entire 63% of the 32 members of the Centre Party faction are non-Estonian. This trend has continued in next elections.<sup>181</sup> On 31 May of 2015 Estonian Social Democratic Party elected Mr Jevgeni Ossinovski, an ethnically Russian, as a leader of the party. This is the first instance of ethnic Russian reaching such a high position in a mainstream political party that is also part of the coalition.<sup>182</sup> This has taken place largely due to the second and in some instances the third generation of migrants who are born or lived significant part of their lives in independent democratic Estonia entering of the labour market and politics.</p> <p>According to the Integration Monitoring survey 2011 the trend among the majority population is towards more acceptance of political participation of minorities on equal basis with ethnic Estonians. There is also a decrease in the sense of unequal treatment regarding the social and political participation among the minorities. However, it must be noted that the sense of unequal opportunities is still rather high among</p>
--	--	---

<sup>177</sup> Cheskin, A. (2015). Identity and Integration of Russian Speakers in the Baltic States: A Framework for Analysis. *Ethnopolitics: Formerly Global Review of Ethnopolitics*, 72-93, 14 (1). Available at:

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/17449057.2014.933051#.VPgjcfmUdvR>

<sup>178</sup> Nimmerfeldt, G., Schulze, J., Taru, M. (2011). The Relationship between Integration Dimensions among Second Generation Russians in Estonia. *Studies of Transition States and Societies*, 76-91, 3 (1). Available at:

<http://publications.tlu.ee/index.php/stss/article/view/72>

<sup>179</sup> Estonia, Kallas, K. (2012). "Monitoring integration in Estonia" in *Measuring and monitoring immigrant integration in Europe*. Rob Bijl and Arjen Verweij (eds). The Netherlands Institute for Social Research

<sup>180</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), p. 242. Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>181</sup> Estonia, Kallas, K. (2008). "The participation of non-Estonians in Estonian social life and politics" in *Estonian Human Development Report 2007*. Eesti Koostöö Kogu, Tallinn: 2008. Available at: [http://kogu.ee/public/trykised/EIA07\\_eng.pdf](http://kogu.ee/public/trykised/EIA07_eng.pdf)

<sup>182</sup> Estonia, Delfi (2015). 'Jevgeni Ossinovski got elected as SDE leader with big majority' (*Jevgeni Ossinovski valiti ülekaalukalt SDE esimeheks*). Available at: <http://www.delfi.ee/news/paevauudised/eesti/fotod-jevgeni-ossinovski-valiti-ulekaalukalt-sde-esimeheks?id=71595313>



		minorities with higher educational levels and good knowledge of Estonian language. This indicates to the possible glass ceiling effects existing regarding the opportunities for fully equal use of rights in labour market and political life. <sup>183</sup>
--	--	--

### 3.9. Use of funding instruments (EIF, ERF, EMIF)

<p>Please provide briefly information and documented insights about the allocation and distribution of funds aimed at supporting political and social participation, and active citizenship measures for migrants and/or their descendants.</p>		<p>The measures developed for the use of EIF funding have mainly concentrated on better service provision for TCNs, Estonian language learning and encouraging contacts between the host population and the TCNs. The distribution of EIF funds per year and measure is as follows:<sup>184</sup></p> <p>2010 - Total funds allocated: €928,160.60 out of which own funds: €309,386.87. Measures: Implementation of actions designed to put the „Common Basic Principles for immigrant integration policy in the European Union“ into practice: €1,224,765.14; Policy capacity building, coordination and intercultural competence building in the Member States across the different levels and departments of government implementation: €12,782.33. In 2010, the bulk of funding was directed towards Estonian language learning facilitation and including TCNs in a dialogue with Estonian citizens by creating opportunities for debates and forum discussions.</p> <p>2011 - Total funds allocated: €962,830.64 out of which own funds: €320,943.55. Measures: Promoting the educational and cultural integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs): €860,860.00; Supporting the creation of a common media field for Estonian citizens and TCN: €505,130.00; Seminar „The Role of Culture in the Integration Process“: €31,960.45. In 2011 the main emphasis of the programme was on educational and cultural integration and the creation of a common media field, which was seen as bringing along better political participation and active citizenship practices.</p> <p>2012 - Total funds allocated: €1,191,184.41 out of which own funds: €397,061.47. Measures: Supporting the integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs) in Estonia: €686,000.00; Supporting the development of media and information fields, which would support the integration of TCNs: €647,000.00; Data gathering, analyzing and planning activities and services directed to TCNs living in Estonia: €209,956.00; Additional training for organising Estonian language learning in Estonian</p>
---	--	---

<sup>183</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>184</sup> Estonia, Estonian Ministry of Culture (*Kultuuriministeerium*), E-mail correspondence with Ms Pille Penk, cultural diversity advisor, 2 March 2015.

		<p>language based educational institutions for TCNs: €35,000.00; Organising training seminars and educational visits for organisations involved with integration: €36,067.68.</p> <p>In 2012 more attention was paid to TCNs' citizenship exam preparations, as well as notifying TCNs about the citizenship acquisition opportunities, and the participation of TCNs in integration discussions.</p> <p>2013 - Total funds allocated: €1,281,854.2 out of which own funds: €427,284.74.</p> <p>Measures: Supporting the development of media and information fields, which would support the integration of TCNs: €94,000.00; Additional training for organising Estonian language learning in Estonian language based educational institutions for TCNs: €807,438.00; Organising training seminars and educational visits for organisations involved with integration: €819,219.00; Supporting the integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs) in Estonia: €24,895.00.</p> <p>In 2013 the only measure intended to increase political activity and active citizenship, except for different language learning opportunities, was the provision of preparatory courses for TCNs who wish to apply for citizenship and have to pass the citizenship exam.</p>
<p>In particular provide a breakdown of funding for the relevant actions and measures by area (political participation, social participation and membership, indicating the source of funding (EIF, ERF, national, regional, other funding source) by <b>using the Annex 5</b></p>		

### 3.10.Key legal and policy developments, and relevant case law

<p>In this section, please provide information about developments regarding the above legal and policy instruments concerning participation (political, consultation, membership and association, active citizenship and civic education), including any new legislative or policy initiatives in the framework of migrant integration in the country. Key developments may be new legislation or policies, abolition,</p>		<p>There have been no key developments in legislation or policies concerning the participation. The legal acts regulating political rights of non-citizens have not been changed recently.</p> <p>The Roundtable of National Minorities (<i>Rahvusvähemuste Ümarlaud</i>) that was created at the President of Estonia office with an aim to operate as a consultative body for minorities and migrants has not been in function since 2011. However, the practice of consultation with migrants regarding the policy documents that affect this group in society has been established in ad hoc basis. The extensive consultations with TCNs were carried out during the preparation of the new national integration strategy.<sup>185</sup></p> <p>A study conducted by the Institute of Baltic Studies (<i>Balti Uuringute Instituut</i>) developed several recommendations regarding promoting equal treatment and equal opportunities in Estonia, among</p>
--	--	--

<sup>185</sup> Estonia, Uus, M. & Kaldur, K. (2013). Open Forums on Integration: Report on Recommendations by Third-Country Nationals regarding Estonia's Integration Policy (*Euroopa kolmandate riikide kodanike lõimumisarutelu aruanne*), Praxis Centre for Policy Studies, Institute of Baltic Studies. Available at: [file:///C:/Users/Pille/Downloads/MISA\\_raport\\_ENGL.pdf](file:///C:/Users/Pille/Downloads/MISA_raport_ENGL.pdf)

	<p>update, improvement or reform of existing ones, as well as important case law, court, equality body or administrative cases, that have had or may have an impact on the implementation of legal and policy instruments and on the actual situation on the ground, including public debates and perceptions among the native population and migrants. (Use template in Annex 9).</p>	<p>them recommending to consider positive discrimination towards minorities in recruitment to the public service.<sup>186</sup> However, no policy changes have taken place in equal treatment area in period. 2010-2014. Several political groupings and civil society organisations have pointed to the problem of under financing of Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner.<sup>187 188</sup></p>
--	--	---

## 4. Social cohesion and community relations

### 4.1. Social cohesion policies

	<p>Does the national integration legal and policy framework refer to social/community cohesion? Is there a clear definition of social/community cohesion? Please report it here – in original language and in full English translation.</p>	<p>The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>) sets as its overall objective "a socially cohesive Estonian society, where people of different linguistic and cultural backgrounds participate actively in the activities of the society and share democratic values." The strategy also includes a definition of social cohesion: Social cohesion - society's ability to ensure the well-being of all its members, to reduce disparities and avoid marginalization (<i>Sotsiaalne sidusus – ühiskonna võimekus tagada kõigi oma liikmete heaolu, vähendada erinevusi ja vältida marginaliseerumist</i>).<sup>189</sup></p>
	<p>Are there any specific measures in place to strengthen social cohesion? Please refer to promising practices and examples of challenges. Use the</p>	<p>The main policy instrument that aims to supporting the strengthening of social cohesion is The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i>) adopted by the government and approved by the parliament at the end of 2014. The strategy has measures targeted at the whole population aiming to develop a common information space, promote values that support integration,</p>

<sup>186</sup> Estonia, Institute of Baltic Studies (*Balti Uuringute Instituut*) (2013). Equal Treatment in Estonia: Awareness and Promotion (*Võrdse kohtlemise edendamise ja teadlikkus Eestis*). Available at: [http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20\(2013\)%20-%20EN.pdf](http://www.ibs.ee/VKE/V%C3%B5rdse%20kohtlemise%20edendamise%20(2013)%20-%20EN.pdf)

<sup>187</sup> Estonia, Request for clarification concerning the financing of the bureau of Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (*Arupärimine. Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise voliniku büroo rahastusest*), 14 November 2012. Available at:

<sup>188</sup> Estonia, ECRI (2010). ECRI Report on Estonia (fourth monitoring cycle) points 64-67. (CRI(2010)3). Adopted 2 March 2010. Available at: <http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/Country-by-country/Estonia/EST-CbC-IV-2010-003-ENG.pdf>

<sup>189</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava\\_loimuv\\_eeesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eeesti.pdf)

<p>template for promising practices in Annex 7 highlighting the most important and/or successful.</p>	<p>tolerance and mutual contacts among people with different cultural, linguistic and ethnic backgrounds.<sup>190</sup> It is too early to evaluate the effectiveness of the measures as the programme has not been in operation properly yet.</p> <p>Until recently, Estonian government's main emphasis has been on Estonian language teaching to the large Russian-speaking part of population. In previous integration strategy 2008-2013, the focus was largely on Estonian language teaching and achieving proficiency in Estonian that was seen as conducive to achieving social cohesion. There was no direct reference to social cohesion.<sup>191</sup></p>
<p>Are there indicators used by authorities to assess, monitor and support social cohesion policies? E.g. social distance, social interaction, intergroup relations, etc. Please provide available relevant data, figures and findings, if any, and present them briefly in the relevant table of the Annex (4).</p>	
<p>Please outline available research, studies, and surveys about the sense of belonging and identification of migrants and/or their descendants with diverse types of local, regional and national identities. Please summarise briefly key findings and any differentiations by nationality or ethnic origin, gender, age and geographic area.</p>	<p>Estonian integration monitoring surveys (2000, 2002, 2005, 2008, 2011) have all surveyed the identity issue of majority and minority part of population. In most recent published survey in 2011 the issues of ethnocultural identity, civic identity and multiple identities were researched. The survey revealed that while Estonian majority identified themselves with only one ethnic group (Estonians), all other groups (Russians, Ukrainians, Belarussians and others) had much more varied group identifications. Multiple identities were most visible among Ukrainians, Belarussians and other nationalities. As among Estonians, also among Russians the characteristic that was considered as most important in national identification was language (77% and 70% respectfully) followed by place of birth for Estonians (66%) and parents and ancestors for Russians (45%). As expected Russians considered place of birth being less important characteristic in ones national identity.<sup>192</sup></p> <p>According to Valk <i>et al</i> there is a "clear empirical distinction between respondents identifying themselves as Russian-Estonian and respondents preferring the self-categorization 'Russian'/.../. The authors claim that in the Russian group the respondents said they would be proud to belong to a state that has adopted multicultural policies and supports multiculturalism also on the personal level. By contrast, the Russian-Estonian group considered national pride and state-level multicultural identity as distinct notions. Yet, these were united through multiculturalism on the personal level. Authors argue that this shows the complexity of ethnic and national identity in the Russian-Estonian group.<sup>193</sup></p>

<sup>190</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eeesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eeesti.pdf)

<sup>191</sup> Estonia, Estonian Integration Strategy 2008-2013 Implementation Plan for 2011-2013, (*Eesti lõimumiskava 2008-2013 rakendusplaan aastateks 2011-2013*). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/eis\\_implementation\\_plan\\_2011-13\\_en\\_1.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/eis_implementation_plan_2011-13_en_1.pdf)

<sup>192</sup> Estonia, Integration Monitoring 2011 (*Integratsiooni monitooring 2011*), Kultuuriministeerium, Policy Research Centre PRAXIS, TNS Emor. Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni\\_monitooring\\_2011.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011.pdf)

<sup>193</sup> Valk, A., Karu-Kletter, K., Drozdova, M. (2011). Estonian open identity: reality and ideals. *TRAMES*, 1-27, 15.

		<p>A qualitative study carried out by Nimmerfeldt states that ‘.../ ethnic identification is not the most salient dimension of the Estonian Russians’ identity. When respondents were asked to define themselves spontaneously during follow-up interviews, none of them referred to their ethnic group, nor did they define themselves through ethno-cultural characteristics. Other identity dimensions, mostly related to social roles and relationships associated with studies, occupational groups, family relations and roles, friends, and often hobby activities, were most frequently presented in the Russian youths’ self-presentations. Furthermore, the reported identifications were ambivalent and dependent on the social situation (whether the young person was with his or her peers or with government officials), as well as on the location (whether the young person was abroad or in Estonia). When respondents of the study were asked to rate the groups along the strength of feelings of belonging, then ‘Russians’ was not the group with the highest score. Instead, groups formed on the basis of linguistic similarities (Russian-speakers), a similar citizenship status (Estonian citizens), and groups comprising all the people living in Estonia (Esländers, in Estonian: Eestimaalased) regardless of ethnic origin were the ones that the respondents felt more closely connected to.<sup>194</sup></p> <p>There are no studies that would focus on the identity formation of more recent immigrants and other immigrants than Soviet time settlers.</p>
	<p>Please indicate legal measures and case law affecting social cohesion and community relations, for example the banning of specific religious or ethnic dress, such as the ‘burqa’.</p>	<p>There are no legal measures or case law affecting social cohesion and community relations.</p>
	<p>Do the action plan or strategy on integration and inclusion of migrants and their descendants address combating racism, xenophobia and intolerance?</p>	<p>The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “<i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i>” (<i>Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”</i>) states that integration is a two-way process, which includes both the host and minority populations<sup>195</sup> and should thus take into account the threats of racism, xenophobia and intolerance. However, these</p>

<sup>194</sup> Nimmerfeldt, K. (2011). Identificational Integration: Conceptualisation and Operationalisation on the Example of Second Generation Russians in Estonia. Institute of Political Science and Governance, Tallinn University, Tallinn, Estonia.

<sup>195</sup> Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia “*Lõimuv Eesti 2020*” (*Lõimumisvaldkonna arengukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020”*) (2014). Available at: [http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava\\_loimuv\\_eesti.pdf](http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf); Estonian Ministry of Culture (*Kultuuriministeerium*) (2014). The Implementation Plan for the Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Arengukava “Lõimuv Eesti 2020” rakendusplaan aastateks 2014–2017*). Available at: <http://www.kul.ee/et/valdkondlik-arengukava-loimuv-eesti-2020>.

<p>Are there specific integration/inclusion actions related to racism and intolerance for education and/or for young people? If yes, how are such actions linked to general integration and/or social inclusion and/or cohesion policy? Please provide information on implementation and impact of such plans and refer to any assessment of their impact?</p>	<p>problems have not been addressed by any concrete measures in the related implementation plan.<sup>196</sup></p>
<p>Please provide information about state and non-state responses via positive measures, campaigns, partnerships involving migrants and communities. Please provide information only about those actions that focus on migrants and on <u>prevention</u> and promotion of peaceful living together and integration as mutual accommodation combating racism and intolerance. Please outline any assessment about their impact and identify any relevant promising practice. (Use the template for promising practices in Annex 7).</p>	<p>There have been no positive measures, campaigns, partnerships involving migrants on promotion of peaceful living together and integration taking place in 2010-2014.</p>

<sup>196</sup> Estonia, Estonian Ministry of Culture (*Kultuuriministeerium*) (2014) .The Implementation Plan for the Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia 2020 (*Arengukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" rakendusplaan aastateks 2014–2017*) .Available at: <http://www.kul.ee/et/valdkondlik-arengukava-loimuv-eesi-2020>.



## 4.2. Combating racism and intolerance

<p>Are there any policy measures, initiatives and practices to accommodate for ethnic or religious differences, for example in regard to sharing public space, such as swimming pools at local level?</p> <p>Identify any promising practices encouraging social interaction and contacts of people of different backgrounds at local level (<b>use the template for promising practices in annex 7</b>).</p>	<p>Estonia has very few (single cases) of migrants from noticeable minorities – different race or religious practices. The majority of migrants come from Russia, Ukraine and former Soviet Republics. There are no instances of the requests for policy measures, initiatives or practices to accommodate ethnic or religious differences in public places.</p> <p>The issue of street names written in Cyrillic alphabet has been controversial since the restoration of independence in 1991. According to the Place Name Act (<i>Kohanimeseadus</i>) the names of the places, including streets, must be written and spelled in Estonian alphabet and in Estonian language.<sup>197</sup> In September 2014 Language Inspectorate requested some of the municipalities (Vaivara, Narva-Jõesuu and Kuressaare) to replace bilingual streets signs with Estonian language signs only.</p>
<p>Please indicate concrete measures, initiatives or programmes targeting migrants and/or descendants aiming at building trust in public institutions, especially at local level. E.g. campaigns, opening doors and reaching out to citizens, social centres, informal collective bodies, cultural events etc.</p> <p>Please provide notable examples of promising practice (<b>use the template for promising</b></p>	<p>Local level actions are sporadic and not well-documented.</p> <p>There have been no national level campaigns or opening doors to immigrant, mainly Russian-speaking population in order to build trust in public institutions.</p> <p>The National Independence Day military parade in February 2015 took place in border town Narva, where 97% of population is of immigrant background. The military parade was organised together with NATO allies and the military equipment was demonstrated for Narva citizens to take a closer look and communicate with NATO and Estonian soldiers.</p> <p>Estonia celebrates annually A Citizens Day (26 November) that aims to promote active citizenship and that is largely focused on children with migrant background. During that week a Citizen of the Year is elected and in several instances the award has been given to a Russian person. During that week visits of schoolchildren from Russian-language schools into Parliament also take place. Since 2008 soon Citizen Day the Government together with the office of the President of Estonia is organising festive citizenship ceremonies for all those who have acquired citizenship during the calendar year.</p>

<sup>197</sup> Estonia, Place Name Act (*Kohanimeseadus*) § 9 (1) and § 10 (1). RT I 2003, 73, 485. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/akt/733937>

	<p><b>practices in annex 7).</b></p> <p>Are there any specific ethical or other guidelines or rules concerning the language used by media or journalists, when writing about migrants and/or their descendants? In this case please provide briefly information about actual application of such rules and challenges.</p>	<p>There are no rules concerning the language media uses when writing about migrants and/or their descendants. Special teaching and/or information materials have been drafted by the International Organization for Migration Estonian office (IOM) in order to inform the media about the situation of refugees and the both ethically and legally correct terminology one should use when writing about the topic.<sup>198</sup></p>
--	--	---

### 4.3. Mixed marriages

	<p>Mixed marriages are often used as an index for social distance and integration or, even, assimilation. Mixed (citizenship) marriages are defined as those where one of the spouses has foreign citizenship and the other has national citizenship (including registered partnerships, common-law marriages). Please indicate legal limitations, if any, for marriages between nationals and foreigners, e.g. for asylum seekers, third country nationals, etc. Do these limitations</p>	<p>There are no limitations to marriages between nationals and foreign citizens. However, specific bureaucratic and official procedures need to be followed before gaining the right to marry in Estonia. For some foreign nationals, these procedures are less hazardous than for others – EU citizens are required to submit less official documents than third country nationals. According to the Vital Statistics Registration Act (<i>Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus</i>) if an alien wishes to contract marriage in Estonia, he or she shall in addition prove that he or she has a legal basis for the stay in Estonia specified in the Aliens Act.<sup>199</sup> At the same time a citizen of a Member State of the European Union or a person who is considered to be a family member of a citizen of the European Union pursuant to the Citizen of European Union Act (<i>Euroopa Liidu kodaniku seadus</i>) is not required to prove that he or she has a legal basis for the stay in Estonia.<sup>200</sup> Furthermore, a person whose residence is in a foreign state or who has resided in Estonia less than six months immediately before the submission of an application for marriage is required to submit a certificate of legal capacity to contract marriage.<sup>201</sup></p> <p>A foreigner who is not a resident of Estonia and who wishes to marry in Estonia has to submit a certificate issued by the corresponding competent state authority of their country of residence or country of nationality which certifies that, according to the law of the country of residence or country of</p>
--	--	--

<sup>198</sup> Estonia, Refugees and Estonian Media. Educative Material for Journalists (*Pagulased ja Eesti media. Juhendmaterjal ajakirjanikele*) (2012). International Organisation for Migration Estonian office. Available at:

<http://iom.ee/failid/content/Ajakirjanike%20juhendmaterjal%20-%20Pagulased%20ja%20eesti%20meedia%202012.pdf>

<sup>199</sup> Estonia, Vital Statistics Registration Act (*Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus*), § 38 (3). RT I 2009, 30, 177. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/504022014001/consolide>

<sup>200</sup> Estonia, Vital Statistics Registration Act (*Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus*), § 38 (4). RT I 2009, 30, 177. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/504022014001/consolide>

<sup>201</sup> Estonia, Vital Statistics Registration Act (*Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus*), § 39 (3). RT I 2009, 30, 177. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/504022014001/consolide>

	<p>result in practical barriers?</p>	<p>nationality, there are no inhibiting factors to the contraction of marriage. The certificate will expire if the marriage is not contracted within six months after the certificate has been issued. In case a shorter validity period has been noted on the certificate, this date will be relied on. The certificate needs to be valid during the time of the contraction of marriage. The certificate in question needs to be either legalized or certified by an apostil. The certificate needs to be presented together with an Estonian translation certified by a notary, a consular officer or a sworn translator.<sup>202</sup></p> <p>Pursuant to §39 (5) of Vital Statistics Registration Act (<i>Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus</i>) a citizen of a foreign state whose residence is in a foreign state or who has resided in Estonia less than six months immediately before the submission of an application for marriage and who is unable to submit a certificate of legal capacity to contract marriage with good reason may be granted permission for contraction of marriage without the certificate by the court in whose territorial jurisdiction the marriage is intended to be contracted.<sup>203</sup></p> <p>A person who has been previously married needs to also submit a document certifying the termination or annulling of their marriage (a death certificate or a divorce certificate).<sup>204</sup></p>
	<p>Are there any official or non-official data and information on mixed marriages (between nationals and people with another citizenship)? Please provide % proportions on the total number of marriages in a given period, as well as data – where available - about ages, country of origin/birth of migrant spouses.</p>	<p>There exists official statistical data on the place of residence of men getting married in Estonia (i.e. whether they are living in Estonia, outside of Estonia or whether their place of residence is unknown). However, one can only make very vague conclusions based on this data (it might be more probable that men residing outside of Estonia are also foreign nationals but one cannot be sure).<sup>205</sup> Thus, no exact data is available.</p>

<sup>202</sup> Estonia, Vital Statistics Registration Act (*Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus*), § 6. RT I 2009, 30, 177. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/504022014001/consolide>

<sup>203</sup> Estonia, Vital Statistics Registration Act (*Perekonnaseisutoimingute seadus*), §39 (5). RT I 2009, 30, 177. Available at: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/504022014001/consolide>

<sup>204</sup> Estonia, Police and Border Guard Board (*Politse- ja Piirivalveamet*). Available at: <https://www.politsei.ee/en/>

<sup>205</sup> Estonia, Statistics Estonia database. Available at: [http://pub.stat.ee/px-web.2001/I\\_Databas/Population/03Vital\\_events/12Marriages/12Marriages.asp](http://pub.stat.ee/px-web.2001/I_Databas/Population/03Vital_events/12Marriages/12Marriages.asp)

## Annex 2: National and regional level action plans on integration

<b>National / regional level</b> <i>(specify region)</i>	<b>Year of the first edition and</b>  <b>Year of latest update</b> <i>(e.g. First edition: 2004, Most recent update: 2011)</i>	<b>Responsible ministry – public authority – reference details</b> <i>(URL – links)</i>	<b>Target groups</b> <b>identify migrant and refugee groups as beneficiaries</b> <i>(e.g. on the basis of their residence status)</i>	<b>Main aims, actions and activities</b> <b>foreseen in the focus areas – link to fundamental rights</b> <i>[provide both key dimensions and specific actions and aims of the policy instruments in each focus area (use a different row for each focus area if needed)]</i>	<b>Targeting general population?</b>  <b>Yes/No – explanatory comments</b> <i>where needed</i>	<b>Insert here definition of integration (in EN) if any. Alternative: Indicate the core aim/objective of the NAP related to social inclusion and/or integration of migrants</b>
National	2000	Ministry of Culture ( <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/state_programme_2000-2007.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/state_programme_2000-2007.pdf</a> )	Yes, but refugees are not mentioned	Linguistic-communicative integration, i.e. the re-creation of a common sphere of information and Estonian-language environment in Estonian society under conditions of cultural diversity and mutual tolerance: (a) Education – The Estonian education system shall become a central area of integration. Teachers shall be prepared for work with a multilingual and multicultural student body; Estonia based textbooks and teaching materials have been created. Adolescents who have completed elementary school will have no linguistic or cultural barriers to continuing their education or competing in the labour market. At the same time	Yes	Integration in Estonian society means on the one hand the harmonisation of society – the creation and promotion of that which unites all members of society – and on the other hand the opportunity to preserve ethnic differences – the offering to ethnic minorities of opportunities for the preservation of their cultural and ethnic distinctiveness. What is of

			<p>the state also supports ethnic minorities' activities in the promotion of education and culture in their native tongue and the preparation of a pedagogical cadre;</p> <p>(b) Knowledge of the Estonian language – non-Estonians' knowledge of the Estonian language shall improve considerably and Estonian will become the predominant language of social interaction. Graduates of non-Estonian elementary schools need not undergo additional examinations beyond school final examinations in order to apply for Estonian citizenship.</p> <p>(c) Changes of attitudes in society - the attitude "non-Estonians as a problem" will be replaced by the attitude "non-Estonians as development potential", "non-Estonians as participants in the strengthening of Estonia." A clear interest on the part of the State in the prospects of non-Estonians and also particularly those of the generation presently maturing in Estonia has created the necessary political atmosphere for real integration, in which on the one hand there has developed a greater readiness for participation among non-</p>	<p>significance here is that integration is a clearly bilateral process - both Estonians and non-Estonians participate equally in the harmonisation of society.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

				Estonians and on the other hand Estonians accept the multiculturalism of Estonian society.		
				<p>Legal-political integration, i.e. the formation of a population loyal to the Estonian State and the reduction of the number of persons lacking Estonian citizenship:</p> <p>(a) Citizenship – In Estonia a situation is being created that permits all non-Estonians who desire Estonian citizenship to fulfil the requirements for its acquisition. The naturalisation process shall become more productive and effective. The political integration of non-Estonians into Estonian life is legally expressed through the possession of Estonian citizenship;</p> <p>(b) Participation in political structures – In the Estonian political landscape a similar political pluralism will develop among both Estonians and non-Estonians;</p> <p>(c) Loyalty - non-Estonians sense that they are full and equal members of Estonian society and perceive their responsibility for the welfare of the Estonian State.</p>		
				Socio-economic integration, i.e. the achievement of greater		



				<p>competitiveness and social mobility in society regardless of ethnic or linguistic attributes:</p> <p>(a) Participation in Estonian social life – barriers restricting the competitiveness of non-Estonians in the labour market and in public life decrease. Upon the development of more favourable conditions non-Estonians participate more widely in third sector associations, cultural work and the international exchange of ideas.</p> <p>(b) The reduction of non-Estonians' regional isolation – the mobility within Estonia of both Estonians and non-Estonians will increase as a result of state encouragement and support.</p>		
National	2008	<p>Ministry of Culture (<a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/loimumiskava_2008_2013.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/loimumiskava_2008_2013.pdf</a> )</p> <p>and (<a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011_eng_lyhiversioon.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/integratsiooni_monitooring_2011_eng_lyhiversioon.pdf</a> )</p>	Yes, but refugees are not mentioned	<p>The main conclusion of this integration monitoring is that the integration policy implemented so far, directed at the “Russian speaking population” or “people with undefined citizenship” as socially vague objects of a state policy, should be replaced with an integration process that takes into account each target group’s level of integration and goals based on their specific problems. Such a process should be strategically coordinated, but</p>	Yes	The document takes over the definition of the previous integration monitoring.

				focused on specific areas and goals for each target group and involving other ethnicities.		
				Generalising the developments in integration policy and lessons learnt so far, and trying to predict the best way for continuing the integration process and implementing a more effective integration policy after the end of the current integration programme in 2013, the authors could theoretically list four scenarios for implementing integration policy. Rather than being empirical descriptions, these scenarios are logical models based on two central choices: first, the choice between an integration policy with a targeted strategic direction or a policy with no such direction and rather a fragmented organisation adapted to external expectations, and second, the choice of defining the minorities' own position in the integration policy: whether they are passive objects or active subjects, who are involved in both the preparation and implementation phases.		
				The recommended mode is cooperation: A single centre coordinating integration policies, development and		

				<p>implementation of a strategy for engaging interest groups. Important decisions are reached by consensus and implemented by the interest groups in a constructive manner. Bringing about significant changes and new paradigms is possible. Facilitates reducing estrangement and security risks. Increases the efficiency of human resources.</p>		
National	2015	<p>Ministry of Culture (<a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loi_muv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loi_muv_eesti.pdf</a> )</p>	<p>Yes, but refugees are not specifically targeted</p>	<p>Attitudes and values supporting integration are embedded in the Estonian society:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Support for common information space and cultural diversity awareness;</li> <li>(b) Support for daily contacts generation, interaction and involvement in the society;</li> <li>(c) Support for the mother tongue and culture of ethnic minorities.</li> </ul>	Yes	<p>The multilateral process of the formation of social cohesion in society between people with different linguistic and cultural backgrounds. The process is characterized by knowledge and skill acquisition and the evolution of values that contribute to the development of society through practical cooperation and mutual openness. As a result of integration, society's socio-economic inequality and unequal social participation will not be caused by</p>

						differences in cultural, linguistic, religious and ethnic affiliations, and the resulting social capital enables the Estonian society to evolve coherently.
				<p>The participation of little integrated Estonian permanent residents with the background of foreign origin in the society has grown through the acquisition of Estonian citizenship and by gaining new knowledge about the society;</p> <p>(a) Creating opportunities for little integrated Estonian permanent residents with the background of foreign origin to increase their social activity and support their integration;</p> <p>(b) Supporting political and juridical integration;</p> <p>(c) Promoting equal treatment at the job market.</p>		
				<p>The recently immigrated have adapted to the Estonian society:</p> <p>(a) Providing adaption courses for the recently immigrated;</p> <p>(b) Developing a web of support services for the adaption courses of the recently immigrated</p>		
				Estonian students with a mother tongue other than Estonian have competitive knowledge and skills		

				<p>for coping with the Estonian language environment:</p> <p>(a) Providing Estonian people with a mother tongue other than Estonian with competitive educational opportunities;</p> <p>(b) Supporting transition to Estonian language based learning, language immersion and the implementation and conduct of integrated subject teaching techniques.</p>		
				<p>Estonian youth with a mother tongue other than Estonian participate actively in youth work and have developed close contacts with the Estonian speaking youth:</p> <p>(a) Increasing the opportunities for youth's public initiatives, joint activities and participation.</p>		
				<p>Guaranteeing the working age population with a mother tongue other than Estonian opportunities for developing their knowledge and skills to participate competitively at the labour market:</p> <p>(a) Improving the ability of people from other nationalities to find work ;</p> <p>(b) Improving the Estonian language proficiency of people with a mother tongue other than Estonian.</p>		

## Annex 4: Indicators monitoring migrant integration - social inclusion/cohesion



N.	Indicator	Definition	Legal frame / policy target	Data source	Periodicity	Reference / Comments
1	The share of people considering themselves to be part of Estonian nation	Indicator measures the responses to the question: There are many ethnic groups living in Estonia who all together form Estonian nation. If you think about yourself as carrier of your ethnic identity what is your primary identification? ( <i>Eestis elab palju rahvusi, kes kõik kokku moodustavad Eestimaa rahva. Kui mõtlete endast kui oma rahvuse esindajast ja Eestimaa rahva esindajast, siis kelle hulka kuuluvaks Te end peate?</i> ) Indicator is measured both among the whole population as well as among people with different ethnic/migrant background.	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Integration Monitoring Survey	Every three years	National level, social cohesion and identity Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arenqukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arenqukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
2	The share of people of minority ethnic background who have a strong or quite strong sense of Estonian national identity.	The indicator is measured based on the index that will be developed in 2015.	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Integration Monitoring	Every three years	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arenqukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arenqukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
3	The frequency of contacts between Estonians and people of minority ethnic background.	Indicator is measured with a question: Have you had contacts with Estonians/Russians and other Russian-speakers within last six months? ( <i>Kas te olete viimase poole aasta jooksul suhelnud eestlastega/venelastega jt vene keelt kõnelevate inimestega?</i> )	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Integration Monitoring	Every three years	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arenqukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arenqukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
4	The difference between Estonians and people of minority ethnic background	The indicator is measured with the following questions: Have you been doing voluntary work within last year?	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and	Integration Monitoring	Every three years	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia

	with regard to participation in third sector organisations	Are you a member of any association or society club (for example housing management association, cultural association, trade union or political party)? ( <i>Mõeldes viimasele aastale, kas olete teinud vabatahtlikku tööd? Kas Te olete mõne ühenduse, seltsi liige (nt korteriühistu, kultuuriselts, noorteklubi, heategevusselts, ametühing või poliitiline erakond)?</i> )	Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)			"Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
5	The share of people with open attitudes according to the tolerance index	The index is formed based on survey responses to 3 questions with opposing statements.	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Integration Monitoring	Every three years	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
6	The number of people who have received Estonian citizenship through naturalisation		Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Estonian Police and Border Guard Board	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
7	The number of people with undefined citizenship		Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Estonian Police and Border Guard Board	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/arengukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
8	The number of newly arrived immigrants who have participated in welcoming programme	The number of new immigrants who assess their levels of competitiveness higher after having passed the welcoming programme courses	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"	Estonian Ministry of the Interior	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014).

			( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)			Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
9	The average scores of basic and upper-secondary school level pupils' exams in Estonian as a second language	The average scores of pupils of basic school state exam in Estonian as a foreign language; the average scores of pupils of upper-secondary school state exam in Estonian as a foreign language. 100 points scale.	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	SA Innove	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
10	The share of vocational school students passing B2 level Estonian language tests as a share from the all exam takers		Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	SA Innove	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
11	The ratio of students from schools teaching in languages other than Estonian reaching high levels of proficiency	High levels in science and reading are measured with PISA levels 5 and 6 and comparison is taken with students from Estonian language schools	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	PISA tests	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
12	The ratio of young people with low levels of education and not in study between the Estonian mother tongue group and other mother tongue groups	Low levels of education are measured as basic education or lower. The age group is 18-24	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014)	Statistics Estonia	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia " <i>Lõimuv Eesti 2020</i> " ( <i>Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020"</i> ) (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
13	Youth involvement in youth work in municipalities	Youth involvement in youth work is measured in municipalities where a	Estonia, The Strategy of	Undecided at the moment	Annually	National level

		majority of population speak mother tongue other than Estonian, compared to the Estonian average. The age groups is 7-26. The indicator is measured as index of the following indicators: participants in interest schools and clubs, contacts in information and advisory centres, number of members in youth associations, number of participants in youth summer camps.	Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014)			Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
14	The proficiency in Estonian among people with a mother tongue other than Estonian	The proficiency is measured based on the respondents reported language proficiency.	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014)	Integration Monitoring	Every three years	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
15	The unemployment rate of Estonians and non-Estonians	Measured as a difference between Estonians and non-Estonians unemployment rates	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014)	Statistics Estonia	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>
16	The employment rate of Estonians and non-Estonians	Measured as a difference between Estonians and non-Estonians employment rates	Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014)	Statistics Estonia	Annually	National level Estonia, The Strategy of Integration and Social Cohesion in Estonia "Lõimuv Eesti 2020" (Lõimumisvaldkonna aregukava "Lõimuv Eesti 2020") (2014). Available at: <a href="http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf">http://www.kul.ee/sites/default/files/aregukava_loimuv_eesti.pdf</a>

## Annex 5: Use of funding instruments

Table 1 - European Integration Fund (EIF)

	European Integration Fund (EIF) - TOTAL	Own funds	Funds distribution (received)/ Thematic areas							
2010	€928,160.6	€309,386	Educational opportunities for TCN children	Inter-cultural understanding and tolerance; Supporting different forms of dialogue	Development of contacts (support for NGOs)	Mentoring and adaptation of recently arrived TCNs	Further development of the Estonian language level assessment system	Free preparatory courses for naturalization	Citizenship education of youth	Supporting media on the topics of integration, equal opportunities and treatment, historical and cultural values, traditions and citizenship
			€115,040.96	€236,473.10	€210,908.44	€79,888.73	€31,955.83	€63,911.64	€134,214.46	€333,692.68
	European Integration Fund (EIF) - TOTAL	Own funds	Funds distribution / Thematic areas							
			Promoting the educational and cultural integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs)			Supporting the creation of a common media field for Estonian citizens and TCN		Seminar „The Role of Culture in the Integration Process”		
2011	€962,830.6	€320,943	€860,860.00			€505,130.00		€31,960.45		

	European Integration Fund (EIF) - TOTAL	Own funds	Funds distribution / Thematic areas				
			Supporting the integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs) in Estonia	Supporting the development of media and information fields, which would support the integration of TCNs	Data gathering, analyzing and planning activities and services directed to TCNs living in Estonia	Additional training for organising Estonian language learning in Estonian language based educational institutions for TCNs	Organising training seminars and educational visits for organisations involved with integration
2012	€1,191,184	€397,061	€686,000.00	€647,000.00	€209,956.00	€35,000.00	€36,067.68
	European Integration Fund (EIF) - TOTAL	Own funds	Funds distribution / Thematic areas				
			Supporting the integration of Third Country Nationals (TCNs) in Estonia	Supporting the development of media and information fields, which would support the integration of TCNs	Additional training for organising Estonian language learning in Estonian language based educational institutions for TCNs	Organising training seminars and educational visits for organisations involved with integration	
2013	€1,281,854	€427,284	€807,438.00	€819,219.00	€24,895.00	€94,000.00	

\* Please indicate if Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund is used for 2014



Table 2 - European Refugee Fund (ERF) aiming at integration of beneficiaries of international protection<sup>206</sup>

	European Refugee Fund (ERF) - TOTAL	Own funds (national)/regional	Funds distribution / Thematic areas					
			Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/ (projects focusing on offering legal assistance to asylum seekers, training officials, IT-development)	Implementation of a functional, quick and high-quality asylum procedure/international co-operation (projects focusing on sharing best practices in order to improve asylum procedures)	Readiness for massive influx of refugees (projects focusing on collaboration between administrations in order to enhance capability to face massive influx)	Studies for mapping and evaluating asylum related services, people's attitudes to give input for policy makers	Improvement of asylum seekers reception conditions (projects focusing on helping asylum seekers and beneficiaries of international protection in new social environment: support person service, psychological and social counselling, cultural orientation trainings, recreation events, etc)	Awareness of the general public (information campaigns, seminars to raise awareness of the society about asylum issues)
2010	€485,683.12	€121,420.82	€79,737.63	€42,599.39	€120,923.33	€0.00	€97,099.69	€72,751.57
2011	€495,626.06	€123,906.54	€102,908.94	€16,793.31	€0.00	€27,760.00	€144,414.47	€124,524.51
2012	€442,438.07	€110,609.54	€157,346.25	€20,049.00	€0.00	€25,774.11	€113,910.65	€58,204.67
2013 <sup>207</sup>	€536,881.86	€134,220.47	€360,272.92	€25,000.00	€0.00	€0.00	€219,774.34	€7000.00
2014	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

\* Please indicate if Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund is used for 2014

<sup>206</sup> NB! The funds assigned to each section include personnel costs but not technical costs

<sup>207</sup> Committed at the level of the MS

## Annex 7: Promising practices

N/A.

## Annex 8: Discrimination complaints submitted to Equality Bodies

Table 3 – Numbers of discrimination cases on any ground submitted by third country nationals (TCNs) in 2014\*

(complaints lodged to the Estonian Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner in 2013)

Number of cases (report the 10 Largest nationality group that submitted a complaint by the end of 2014)	Grounds								
	Racial or ethnic origin	Nationality (where applicable) (According to the Estonian Equal Treatment Act ( <i>Võrdse kohtlemise seadus</i> ), citizenship cannot be the basis of discrimination.) <sup>208</sup>	Race / skin colour	Religion / faith/ belief	disability	gender	Sexual orientation / gender identity	age	other
Nationality groups cannot be defined <sup>209</sup>	5		1					1	

\* Provide data for 2013 if 2014 not available by March 2015

<sup>208</sup> Estonia, Estonian Equal Treatment Act (*Võrdse kohtlemise seadus*), RT I 2008, 56, 315. Available here: <https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/530102013066/consolide>

<sup>209</sup> Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (*Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise volinik*) Ms Mari-Liis Sepper, e-mail correspondence 30 March 2015.

Table 4 - Outcome of discrimination cases on grounds of ethnic origin submitted by third country nationals\*

Competent Body (e.g. Equality Body, Administrative court etc.)	Outcome						
	Pending from previous years	Pending – submitted in 2014	Established discrimination	Shift of the burden of proof applied	Successful mediation – restoring rights/fairness – sanctions applied	Unsuccessful mediation	Not admissible (formal admissibility / withdrawal reasons)
Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner ( <i>Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise volinik</i> )			1		1	2	3

\* Provide data for 2013 if 2014 not available by March 2015

## Annex 9: Case law – max 5 leading cases

<b>Thematic area</b>	Discrimination on grounds of nationality (ethnic origin) during the recruitment process
<b>Decision date</b>	On 16 August 2012
<b>Reference details</b>	Estonia, Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner ( <i>Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise volinik</i> ) (2012) 'Seoses XX kaebusega Välisministeeriumi vastu, mis puudutab tööle värbamisel tema diskrimineerimist rahvuse tõttu', Opinion, 16 August 2012
<b>Key facts of the case</b> (max. 500 chars)	The complainant questioned if the Ministry of Foreign Affairs ( <i>Välisministeerium</i> ) treated her/him equally during the recruitment for a diplomatic position. The complainant belongs to Russian ethnic minority, whose mother tongue is Russian, the professional education was received in Estonian language. The job description for the position mentioned that the successful candidate should have very good Estonian language knowledge. The Ministry requested candidates to self-evaluate the Estonian language knowledge, this requirement applied only to non-Estonians. The evaluation grid had C2 as the highest level (equal to mother tongue). The applicant assessed her/his level as C1 as this is the highest level for which the proficiency exam can be taken and also as this is the level required for this position by the law. Later on the Ministry claimed that “very good knowledge” should be equal to C2 level, also they mentioned that in the motivation letter the candidate used simple sentences that meant that the language proficiency of the candidate is not high enough.
<b>Main reasoning/argumentation</b> (max. 500 chars)	The Commissioner came to a conclusion that in this particular case the complainant has been discriminated when accessing employment. The Commissioner decided, based on EU case-law, that in this case discrimination based on the language knowledge should be considered equal to ethnic discrimination as mother tongue is attribute of ethnicity. The Ministry violated the equal treatment principle as set in the Equal Treatment Act ( <i>Võrdse kohtlemise seadus</i> ), according to the Act on Public Service ( <i>Avaliku teenistuse seadus</i> ) only the language proficiency level set in the legal acts can be requested upon employment. In this case the requested level (C2) was higher than envisaged (C1) in the Language Act ( <i>Keeleseadus</i> ). The Ministry did not take into consideration the fact that the applicant received the professional education in Estonian language and therefore is not bound to provide any prove of language proficiency. The Ministry did not take active measures to ensure that all the candidates are treated equally disregarding their ethnic background. <sup>210</sup>

<sup>210</sup> Estonia, Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (*Soolise võrdõiguslikkuse ja võrdse kohtlemise volinik*) (2012) 'Seoses XX kaebusega Välisministeeriumi vastu, mis puudutab tööle värbamisel tema diskrimineerimist rahvuse tõttu', Opinion, 16 August 2012.

<p><b>Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case</b></p> <p>(max. 500 chars)</p>	<p>The key issue clarified is that according to the Act on Public Service (<i>Avaliku teenistuse seadus</i>) only the language proficiency level set in the legal acts can be requested upon employment. In this case the requested level (C2) was higher than envisaged (C1) in the Language Act (<i>Keeleseadus</i>). Furthermore, the Ministry did not take into consideration the fact that the applicant received the professional education in Estonian language and therefore is not bound to provide any prove of language proficiency.</p>
<p><b>Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case</b></p> <p>(max. 500 chars)</p>	<p>The opinion of the Commissioner are legal assessments provided to the person who requested the assessment, but they are not legally consequential to the parties involved. It is not known whether the person involved in the case pursued the case with an official complaint in the court.</p>
<p><b>Key quotation in original language and translated into English with reference details</b></p> <p>(max. 500 chars)</p>	<p>The Estonian language version of the opinion can be reached here: <a href="http://www.vordoigusvolinik.ee/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/16.08.2012_arvamus_anonymiseeritud.pdf">http://www.vordoigusvolinik.ee/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/16.08.2012_arvamus_anonymiseeritud.pdf</a></p>